This document is confidential and is proprietary to the American Chemical Society and its authors. Do not copy or disclose without written permission. If you have received this item in error, notify the sender and delete all copies.

Biochar agin	g: Mechanisms, physico-chemical changes,
assessmer	nt, and implications for field applications

٦.

Journal:	Environmental Science & Technology
Manuscript ID	es-2020-04033w.R2
Manuscript Type:	Critical Review
Date Submitted by the Author:	16-Oct-2020
Complete List of Authors:	Hou, Deyi; Tsinghua University, Wang, Liuwei; Tsinghua University, School of Environment O'Connor, David; Tsinghua University, Rinklebe, Jörg; Bergische Universitat Wuppertal, School of Architecture and Civil Engineering Ok, Yong Sik; Korea University, Environmental Science and Ecological Engineering Tsang, Daniel; Hong Kong Polytechnic University, Department of Civil and Environmental Engineering Shen, Zhengtao; University of Alberta, Department of Earth and Atmospheric Sciences



1	Biochar aging: Mechanisms, physico-chemical
2	changes, assessment, and implications for field
3	applications
4 5	Liuwei Wang <sup>a</sup> , David O'Connor <sup>a</sup> , Jörg Rinklebe <sup>b,c</sup> , Yong Sik Ok <sup>d</sup> , Daniel C.W. Tsang <sup>e</sup> , Zhengtao Shen <sup>a,f</sup> , Deyi Hou <sup>a*</sup>
6	<sup>a</sup> School of Environment, Tsinghua University, Beijing 100084, China
7 8	<sup>b</sup> University of Wuppertal, School of Architecture and Civil Engineering, Institute of Foundation Engineering, Water- and Waste-Management, Laboratory of Soil- and Groundwater-Management,
9	Pauluskirchstraße 7, Wuppertal, 42285, Germany
10 11	<sup>c</sup> Department of Environment, Energy and Geoinformatics, Sejong University, 98 Gunja-Dong, Seoul, Republic of Korea
12	<sup>d</sup> Korea Biochar Research Center, APRU Sustainable Waste Management Program & Division of
13 14	Environmental Science and Ecological Engineering, Korea University, Seoul 02841, Republic of Korea
15 16	<sup>e</sup> Department of Civil and Environmental Engineering, The Hong Kong Polytechnic University, Hung Hom, Kowloon, Hong Kong, China
17	<sup>f</sup> Department of Earth and Atmospheric Sciences, University of Alberta, Edmonton, T6G 2E3, Canada

18 \*corresponding author (<u>houdeyi@tsinghua.edu.cn</u>)

### 20 ABSTRACT

21 Biochar has triggered a black gold rush in environmental studies as a carbon-rich material with well-22 developed porous structure and tunable functionality. While much attention has been placed on its 23 apparent ability to store carbon in the ground, immobilize soil pollutants, and improve soil fertility, 24 its temporally evolving *in situ* performance in these roles must not be overlooked. After field 25 application, various environmental factors, such as temperature variations, precipitation events and 26 microbial activities, can lead to its fragmentation, dissolution and oxidation, thus causing drastic 27 changes to the physico-chemical properties. Direct monitoring of biochar-amended soils can provide good evidence of its temporal evolution, but this requires long-term field trials. Various artificial aging 28 29 methods, such as chemical oxidation, wet-dry cycling and mineral modification, have therefore been 30 designed to mimic natural aging mechanisms. Here we evaluate the science of biochar aging, critically 31 summarize aging-induced changes to biochar properties, and offer a state-of-the-art for artificial aging 32 simulation approaches. In addition, the implications of biochar aging are also considered regarding 33 its potential development and deployment as a soil amendment. We suggest that for improved 34 simulation and prediction, artificial aging methods must shift from qualitative to quantitative 35 approaches. Furthermore, artificial pre-aging may serve to synthesize engineered biochars for green 36 and sustainable environmental applications.

37

7 **KEYWORDS:** soil carbon; remediation; heavy metals; soil health; climate change mitigation

# 39 TABLE OF CONTENTS (TOC)/ABSTRACT ART



40

### 42 1 INTRODUCTION

Biochar is a carbon-rich porous material that is produced by the pyrolysis or hydrothermal carbonization of raw biomass <sup>1, 2</sup>. While new applications for biochar continue to emerge (e.g., as a catalyst), in general, uses for this material have divided in two directions. One is as an alternative to activated carbon usage in wastewater <sup>3-5</sup> or flue gas treatments <sup>6</sup>. The other is as a soil amendment. Biochar's promise as a soil amendment is tremendous because it offers multiple functions, including increased soil fertility <sup>7, 8</sup>, the remediation of polluted soils <sup>9, 10</sup>, and *in situ* carbon sequestration as a way to mitigate climate change <sup>11</sup>.

50 Land degradation issues around the world hinder global efforts toward meeting food demand <sup>12-15</sup>. 51 Since the discovery of *Terra Preta de índio*, an anthropogenic black and extremely fertile soil in Amazon Basin enriched with charcoal (biochar)<sup>16, 17</sup>, there seems to be a "black gold rush" over the 52 53 past few decades. Today, biochar again promises a potential route to sustainable food security owing 54 to its ability to increase soil fertility levels in various ways including the provision of labile organic 55 carbon, improved soil nutrient retention, improved soil structure, improved water holding capacity, neutralized soil acidification, and more amenable growing conditions <sup>16, 17</sup>. Meta-analysis of 371 56 57 plant productivity studies in soils amended with biochar has indicated its ability to significantly 58 increase above ground productivity and crop yields (p < 0.01 for both productivity and yield, increase by 30% and 19% on average, respectively) 18. 59

60 Meanwhile, the industrialization of developing countries has resulted in heavy metal(loid) 61 contamination across large areas of agricultural land. In China, for example, analysis of 1041 soil 62 samples throughout the country reveals that cadmium is widely encountered in agricultural soils (0.01 63 - 74.75 mg/kg, with the average value of 0.87 mg/kg), leading to concerns over rice crops being

64 contaminated and unsafe for consumption <sup>19, 20</sup>. Over 3.3 millions of hectares of agricultural land are 65 now too contaminated to use due to such pollution issues <sup>21</sup>. Biochar's capability to immobilize 66 harmful soil contaminants *in situ* suggests that this material also promises a potential route to improve 67 food security in areas affected by contaminated soils <sup>9, 22-24</sup>.

Furthermore, soils are a major factor for global greenhouse gas (GHG) emissions and must feature in efforts to tackle the climate crisis. Because biochar's carbon structure is known to be recalcitrant within the soil environment, biochar production and field application offers a potential route to removing carbon from the atmosphere (i.e., during biomass growth) and long-term storage. It is estimated that production of biochar and its field application could potentially offset 12% of anthropogenic CO<sub>2</sub>-C equivalent emissions (i.e., 1.8 Pg CO<sub>2</sub> *vs* 15.4 Pg CO<sub>2</sub> per year)<sup>11</sup>.

74 Although the number of biochar-related studies are booming, the long-term environmental 75 behaviors of biochar are much less explored compared with other research areas such as short-term 76 remediation performances. Once applied to the soil, biochar undergoes an aging process. Various 77 natural forces, such as freeze-thaw cycles (induced by variations in temperature)<sup>25</sup>, wetting-drying cycles (caused by rainfall events)<sup>26</sup>, photochemical degradation (as a result of sunlight irradiation)<sup>27</sup> 78 and mild oxidation (caused by atmospheric oxygen, root exudates or microorganisms) 28, 29 lead to 79 80 significant changes in biochar physicochemical properties, such as the specific surface area (SSA), 81 surface morphology, acidity, elemental composition, ion exchange capacity and the aromaticity. Such 82 changes could either be to the enhancement or detriment of biochar's performance for field 83 applications and long-term carbon storage over time. However, the long-term behavior of biochar 84 within the soil environment has not yet been summarized in sufficient detail. It is time-consuming to 85 monitor the long-term effects of biochar application, since some of the natural aging process can be very slow (half-life more than 1000 years)<sup>30</sup>. Therefore, various artificial aging methods, such as 86

chemical oxidation, physical aging and the biological aging have been proposed as proxies for natural
aging, cutting the aging duration from years or months to days or hours.

89 Based on various aging mechanisms, changes in biochar properties could either enhance or inhibit biochar's performances in soil amendment, environmental remediation and climate change mitigation. 90 91 Furthermore, to embrace a healthy and sustainable agroecosystem, it is necessary to comprehend the 92 role of long-term biochar field application in both agricultural and remediation aspects. The aims of 93 this review are to 1) propose biochar aging mechanisms, and examine aging-induced changes in 94 biochar physico-chemical properties; 2) explore the effects of biochar aging on the basis of aging-95 induced changes in biochar properties; and 3) comprehend the role of biochar long-term aging in 96 sustainable agriculture using a generalized framework. Challenges and potential future research 97 directions are also put forward.

### 98 2 MECHANISMS

Biochar in the soil is subject to various natural aging mechanisms. As biochar's carbon content is largely recalcitrant, full mineralization (e.g., biochar conversion to H<sub>2</sub>O and CO<sub>2</sub>), either by biotic or abiotic pathways is slow, with reported half-lives in the order of 1000 years <sup>30</sup>. Aging mechanisms that result in changed properties are relatively quicker, yet these are still slow to observe in the field. Artificial accelerated aging methods, which mimic natural aging mechanisms, can significantly reduce observation times. The most relevant biochar aging mechanisms are illustrated in **Figure 1** along with implications for artificial accelerated aging methods.

Biochar aging can occur from natural rainfall or freeze-thaw events in seasonally frozen areas which
leads to mechanical fragmentation, surface oxidation, dissolved organic matter (DOM) release and

### Page 7

108 mineral dissolution (i.e., decreased ash content). Such environmental processes can be accelerated 109 experimentally by wet-dry cycling, chemical oxidation and freeze-thaw cycling. Soil mineral 110 interaction with biochar can result in pore blockage and increased biochar mineral content, whereas 111 biochar adsorption of root exudates may cause acidification and mineral dissolution. These processes 112 can be accelerated experimentally by chemical modification. Biological and photochemical processes 113 can result in oxidation and release of biochar's labile carbon content, which can be accelerated 114 experimentally by microbial inoculation and UV irradiation, respectively. The specific mechanisms 115 involved in biochar aging are discussed in the subsections below.





# Page 8

Figure 1. Biochar field aging mechanisms and implications for artificial accelerated aging shown inparenthesis.

### 119 **2.1 Dissolution**

120 The dissolution of mineral components (de-ashing) is an important aging process with agronomic

121 implications. Mineral dissolution from biochar can be divided into two stages <sup>31</sup>:

122 Stage 1 – Initial rapid element detachment induced by ion exchange, submicrometer particle 123 dissolution, and preferential dissolution at crystal imperfections (last for  $t_1$  h);

124 Stage 2 - pH-dependent zero-order reaction (Eq. 1)<sup>31</sup>:

125 
$$R_i = K_i [\mathrm{H}^+]^n \quad (1)$$

where  $R_i$  is the zero-order (constant) reaction rate of element *i* (e.g., K, Ca, Mg, P),  $K_i$  refers to mineral specific rate constant of element *i*, [H<sup>+</sup>] represents the proton activity, *n* is the reaction order for [H<sup>+</sup>].

129 Therefore, the total amount of elements released can be calculated as follows (Eq. 2):

130 
$$Q_{it} = Q_{i1} + R_i(t - t_1) \quad (2)$$

131 where  $Q_{it}$  represents the total amount of released element *i* after these two stages,  $Q_{i1}$  refers to the 132 amount of element *i* during the first stage, *t* is the reaction time.

The dissolution kinetics for different elements may vary. The first stage dissolution of Ca, Mg and
P could last for 24 h, releasing substantial amount of elements from corn straw biochar (27%, 47%,
41% of the total Ca, Mg and P content, respectively). After that, the pH-dependent dissolution of Ca

### Page 9

136  $(R_{Ca} = 0.049 \text{ at pH 6.9})$  and Mg  $(R_{Mg} = 0.108 \text{ at pH 6.9})$  could be faster as compared with P  $(R_{Mg} = 0.016 \text{ at pH 6.9})^{31}$ . Nevertheless, the element K does not obey this two-stage rule, which could be 138 released very rapidly (i.e., release 30% at the first hour in aqueous solution)<sup>31</sup>. A study by Limwikran 139 et al. <sup>32</sup> even observed that the large amount of K released from the fruit waste biochars (i.e., 16,201 140 -33,843 mg/kg) could have displaced sufficient exchangeable Ca from the soil, thus increasing the 141 total Ca in biochar (i.e., by 2,144 – 11,098 mg/kg) after incubation for 8 weeks in different tropical 142 soils.

143 Various natural or anthropogenic events will lower soil pH levels (e.g., the introduction of H<sup>+</sup>), 144 leading to greater mineral release from biochar (Figure 1). Rainfall events are the most important 145 contributor of soil acid. Typically, rainwater is slightly acidic (pH  $\sim$  5.6) due to dissolved CO<sub>2</sub> (i.e., 146 carbonic acid). In the case of acid rain, dissolved air pollutants, such as NO<sub>x</sub> and SO<sub>2</sub>, results in much 147 a lower pH value (pH  $\sim$  4) and greater levels of H<sup>+</sup> being introduced to soils <sup>33</sup>. Moreover, plants 148 release low molecular weight organic acids (LMWOAs), such as citric acid, malic acid, oxalic acid, acetic acid or formic acid, which can also cause biochar minerals to dissolve in the rhizosphere <sup>28, 34,</sup> 149 <sup>35</sup>. This rhizosphere effect has been reviewed in-depth elsewhere <sup>35, 36</sup>. 150

### 151 2.2 Fragmentation

Mechanical disintegration is an important, yet often overlooked, aging mechanism. Rainfall and freeze-thaw cycles are the dominant causes of biochar physical fragmentation and breakdown in the field (**Figure 1**). During rainfall events, water sorbed in biochar can cause graphite sheets to swell, resulting in structural expansion (**Figure S1**) <sup>37</sup>. Expansion and shrinkage of water molecules during the freeze-thaw cycles can also cause physical fragmentation <sup>38</sup>. Compared with more flexible raw biomass, biochar will tend to fracture at relatively low strain under mechanical stress. These structural

### Page 10

defects lead to fragmentation (Figure S1) <sup>37, 39</sup>. Small biochar particles can form in this way, which
are termed dissolved black carbon, with no detectable change to the elemental composition or other
chemical properties <sup>37</sup>.

161

### **2.3** Interactions with soil minerals

162 After biochar is applied to the soil, minerals can interact with it through adsorption reactions and 163 attach onto the biochar surface (Figure 1). The adsorption of soil minerals onto biochar can shield it 164 from decomposition and oxidation processes, and the formation of biochar-mineral complexes enhances long-term carbon sequestration <sup>40, 41</sup>. Soil minerals, such as kaolinite, montmorillonite, iron 165 166 oxides and aluminum oxides can attach tightly to biochar surfaces through the formation of surface complexes such as Fe-O-C, or by incorporation into inner pores, resulting in pore clogging <sup>42</sup> and 167 168 enhanced oxidation resistance <sup>43</sup>. A relatively high Al concentration has been observed at the interface 169 between soil minerals and aged biochars, suggesting the vital role of Al-containing minerals in this interaction <sup>40</sup>. Kaolinite could enhance the oxidation resistance of walnut shell biochar, since the 170 171 content of oxygen-containing functional groups for kaolinite protected biochar was much lower than 172 that of biochar exposed to air after 3 months incubation  $(16.1\% \text{ vs } 36.3\%)^{43}$ . It could be that the soil 173 minerals protected the biochar surface from oxidation via forming a physical barrier (Figure 2e). 174 However, we found that most studies have overlooked the role of soil mineral interactions in assessing 175 biochar aging.

176 **2.4 Biological degradation** 

177 The well-developed porous structure of biochar offers a significant microbial habitat niche <sup>44, 45</sup>. It 178 has long been established that extensive colonization occurs for biochars subjected to hundreds of 179 years of natural aging <sup>46, 47</sup>, yet it is still debated whether soil organisms will colonize biochars

180 effectively in a relatively short aging duration (i.e., several years). After 3 years of field aging, the 181 wood biochar remained sparsely colonized due to the lack of labile carbon <sup>48</sup>. In comparison, grass 182 biochars can not only be easily colonized, but also used as a substrate only after 90 days of short 183 incubation <sup>49</sup>. It is therefore proposed that the carbon bioavailability determines the speed of microbial 184 colonization. The higher the labile carbon content (e.g., aliphatic C compounds), the more rapid the 185 colonization <sup>45</sup>. In addition, the physical fragmentation (i.e., the exposure of more interior surfaces) 186 and abiotic oxidation (i.e., the disintegration and partial oxidation of recalcitrant C) may have 187 accelerated the colonization process <sup>48</sup>.

188 Complete mineralization of biochar (to H<sub>2</sub>O and CO<sub>2</sub>) by microorganisms may take hundreds to 189 thousands of years 30, 50, whereas changes in biochar properties may also be significant due to 190 microbial colonization and degradation after several years of field application. Soil microorganisms 191 play an important role in biochar surface oxidation and labile carbon loss owing to the introduction 192 of additional oxygen-containing functional groups and DOM release (Figure 1)<sup>51</sup>. At the initial stage 193 of microbial degradation, the breakdown of aliphatic C compounds results in the disconnection of 194 aromatic moieties and oxidation at the break points <sup>52</sup>. After mineralization of labile C pool in the 195 short term (usually between 2 to 60 days) <sup>53</sup>, the degradation rate of biochar carbon decreases 196 dramatically. A <sup>14</sup>C isotopic labelling study suggested that the decomposition rate of ryegrass biochar 197 could be very high (up to  $0.15\% d^{-1}$ ) during the first two months of incubation. After that, the decomposition rate decreased sharply to 0.0015% d<sup>-1</sup> and remained stable <sup>50</sup>. Fungi are known to 198 199 degrade recalcitrant carbon in soil 54, 55. An increase in fungal biomass during the second stage of 200 biochar degradation indicated that fungi played vital roles in microbial decomposition of recalcitrant 201 aromatic moieties <sup>54</sup>. In particular, saprophytic fungi (e.g., white-rot fungi) could break down highly

- 202 condensed aromatic structures such as lignin <sup>56, 57</sup> and polycyclic aromatic hydrocarbons (PAHs) <sup>58,</sup>
- <sup>59</sup>, accounting for the long-term degradation of biochar in soil <sup>60</sup>.

204 Soil fauna also contribute to the biological degradation of biochar <sup>53</sup>. As the most widely explored 205 soil macroorganism, earthworm accelerates the aging process via different pathways. Firstly, soil 206 bioturbation and ingestion of biochar by earthworms results in the physical disintegration, thus 207 favoring the abiotic or microbial decomposition <sup>53</sup>. In addition, biochar can be inoculated with 208 microorganisms (e.g., Firmicutes, Actinobacteria, Proteobacteria) while passing through the guts <sup>61</sup>-209 <sup>63</sup>. Considering that microbial colonization could be a slow process for biochars with a high 210 recalcitrant C content (i.e., aromatic rings)<sup>48</sup>, the earthworm-facilitated microbial inoculation may 211 have accelerated the microbial aging. Very limited data suggest that other soil macroorganisms, such 212 as nematodes and arthropods may also be involved in biochar aging. Application of wheat straw 213 biochar significantly increased the abundance of fungivore nematodes (p < 0.05), which may in turn 214 regulate biochar degradation via alterations in soil fungal community <sup>64</sup>. Fecal pellets from arthropods 215 have been observed within a charcoal-rich layer of the forest soil, suggesting that biochar can be 216 ingested and processed by these animals <sup>65, 66</sup>. There is an urgent need to explore the role of these 217 macroorganisms in long-term biochar degradation.

218 **2.5** Abiotic oxidation

Biochar oxidation can occur abiotically or biotically, with a number of studies suggesting that abiotic oxidation plays the dominant role <sup>67-71</sup>. Abiotic biochar oxidation has been observed to occur through various processes.

Atmospheric oxygen-induced oxidation can introduce additional oxygen-containing functional groups, such as hydroxyl, carbonyl and carboxyl, to the biochar surface. This mild oxidation process

### Page 13

is slow at ambient temperature <sup>72</sup>. For instance, atmospheric aging of sludge biochar for 2 months 224 225 could only increase the amount of oxygen-containing functional groups by 2% (incubation temperature 45 °C, measured by the Boehm titration method) <sup>72</sup>. Rainfall events can also result in 226 227 biochar oxidation owing to the dissolved oxygen and nitrogen oxides in rainwater <sup>73-75</sup>. Rainfall 228 events can also lead to physical disintegration and acidification, thus causing labile carbon to be 229 released as DOM, minerals to leach out and additional oxygen-containing functional groups, such as 230 hydroxyl, carbonyl and carboxyl, to be introduced to the biochar surface. It is not yet clear whether 231 biochar is oxidized during freeze-thaw processes. Some studies have reported slight increases in the 232 surface oxygen content, although the precise oxidizing mechanism is unknown <sup>38, 76</sup>. Others studies 233 did not observe any significant changes to biochar's elemental compositions after freeze-thaw cycles 77. 234

235 Photochemical transformation has been observed to be a key abiotic oxidation mechanism. The 236 dissolved black carbon released from biochar could generate reactive oxygen species (ROS), 237 including the hydroxyl radical ( $\cdot$ OH), singlet oxygen ( $^{1}O_{2}$ ), and superoxide ( $O_{2}^{-}$ ) (i.e., the selfgeneration of ROS)<sup>27,78</sup>, which will in turn lead to the phototransformation of biochar. For instance, 238 239 the dissolved organic carbon from the bamboo biochar could generate  ${}^{1}O_{2}$  more effectively (apparent 240 quantum yield 4.07%) than many well-studied photoactive components in terms of ROS generation (apparent quantum yield fell within 1.18% - 2.48%)<sup>79</sup>. In addition, ROS can also be generated directly 241 242 from the biochar matrix. For instance, the carbon matrix of crop residue biochars generated 10% - 45% 243  $^{1}O_{2}$  and 64% - 75%  $\cdot$ OH, whereas the dissolved organic matter derived from biochars accounted for 47% - 86% <sup>1</sup>O<sub>2</sub> and only 4% - 12% ·OH generation <sup>80</sup>. Fenton-like reactions, either with the presence 244 245 of LMWOAs (Section 4.2.2)<sup>27</sup> or persistent free radicals (PFRs)<sup>80</sup>, favor the formation of the ·OH.

Aromatic ketones <sup>81</sup>, aromatic amino acids <sup>82</sup> and quinones <sup>80</sup> are potential chromophores for  ${}^{1}O_{2}$ , whereas the silica minerals <sup>79</sup> and the phenolic groups <sup>83</sup> in biochar play vital roles in  $O_{2}^{-}$  generation.

248

# **3** PHYSICO-CHEMICAL CHANGES

Biochar will display a series of physical and chemical changes overtime due to being subjected to
 aging processes. These physico-chemical changes are discussed in the sub-sections below.

### 251 **3.1** Physical changes

252 Compared with fresh biochar, both naturally aged and artificially aged biochars can display 253 significant differences in their surface morphologies, as revealed by scanning electron microscopy 254 (SEM) imaging (Figure 2). The blockage or fragmentation of the biochar structure will affect 255 properties such as the surface area, pore volume and the pore diameter. It has been reported that 3 256 years of natural field aging in the Qinghai Tibetan Plateau caused the surface morphology of rice husk 257 biochar to become much rougher and show signs of collapse (Figure 2a)<sup>84</sup>. Even when biochar is not applied to soil, atmospheric oxidation can lead to much more irregular structures (Figure 2b) 85. 258 259 Compared with natural aging, the effects of artificial aging on biochar surface morphologies tend to 260 be more pronounced. For example, biochar subjected to artificial wet-dry cycles revealed ruptured 261 pores (Figure 2c) <sup>38</sup>. Artificial chemical oxidation can lead to the presence of floccules of oxidized matter on biochar surfaces <sup>74</sup> (Figure 2d). SEM images have revealed that biochar interactions with 262 263 fine clay particles can lead to severe pore blocking (Figure 2e)<sup>42</sup>. Biological aging can also lead to 264 the blocked pores due to microbial coating (Figure 2f)<sup>86</sup>. Substantial changes in surface morphology 265 is closely related to the environmental implications (Table S2). The exposure of more interior 266 surfaces due to pore collapse results in enhanced exposure and dissolution of inorganic minerals, thus

promoting plant growth in the long run <sup>84</sup>. Although aging with soil minerals will block the pores, the
adsorption capacity towards contaminants could be increased due to the high surface area of the
attached minerals (**Table S2**) <sup>42</sup>.





#### **Environmental Science & Technology**

The specific surface area (SSA) of biochars can either increase or decrease because of aging. Usually, the SSA<sub>aged</sub>:SSA<sub>fresh</sub> ratio will fall between 0.5:1 and 2:1 (**Figure 3a**). A few studies have reported more extreme changes. One study of natural biochar aging reported a 4.5:1 ratio, which was attributed to large amounts of labile carbon loss <sup>87</sup>. Another study involving artificial chemical oxidation induced aging reported a 0.09:1 ratio, which was attributed to the collapse of inner pores <sup>88</sup>.

284 Aging-induced changes to biochar surface area are usually related to biochar oxidation, mineral 285 dissolution, DOM release, or sorption processes that affect the biochar pore structure. For example, 286 increased SSA values after aging may stem from the formation of new pores by the aggregation of 287 biochar and biochar-derived organic substances <sup>38</sup>, dissolution of labile carbon <sup>89</sup>, or chemical 288 oxidation of biochar carbon compounds in acidic or alkaline conditions <sup>71</sup>. In contrast, several 289 mechanisms are attributed to decreased SSA values after aging, including the blockage of pore 290 structures due to the dissolution-precipitation of inorganic minerals <sup>38</sup>, the formation of oxygencontaining functional groups at pore entrances <sup>88</sup>, or physical clogging by soil substances <sup>90</sup>. 291

292 According to the literature reviewed, the total pore volume (TPV) may either increase or decrease 293 (TPV<sub>aged</sub>: TPV<sub>fresh</sub> fell between 0.01:1 and 3.33:1) due to the similar mechanisms. As for pore 294 diameter, current studies suggest that biochar aging may lead to the formation of meso- and micro-295 sized pores. Some studies have indicated that mesopores are more likely to form during chemical 296 oxidation, as evidenced by N<sub>2</sub> adsorption isotherms changing from IUPAC Type I (fresh biochar, 297 microporous) into Type IV (aged biochar, mesoporous) (Figure S2)<sup>29,71,91</sup>. Others have reported that 298 natural aging favors the formation of micropores <sup>89</sup>. This finding was probably due to labile carbon 299 being leached out or degraded by soil microorganisms. Compared with soil fertility improvement, 300 aging-induced changes in porous structure affects more on remediation purposes. Higher surface area indicates more available sites for contaminant binding (especially for organic contaminants) 9, 22. A 301

302 well-developed meso- and micro-pore structure enhances contaminant adsorption via pore filling <sup>42,</sup>

303 <sup>92</sup>. Therefore, an increase in specific area and pore volume favors the immobilization of soil

304 contaminants, and vise versa (Table S2) (Section 5.2).



Figure 3. Reported changes to biochar chemical properties due to aging: (a) specific surface area (SSA); (b) ash content and pH; (c) van Krevelen diagram for biochars subjected to various aging processes; (d) carbon loss and surface oxidation during chemical aging. Literature values are provided in Table S3.

### 310 **3.2** Chemical changes

311 Biochar aging can reduce its ash content and increase its acidity level (i.e., lower pH value). Aging 312 by chemical oxidation results in biochar acidification and the release of ash minerals whereas physical 313 aging is much milder, resulting in only slight variations in biochar pH. In general, the acidification 314 effect is in the order of chemical > natural > physical (Figure 3b). This is because chemical aging 315 by oxidation (using H<sub>2</sub>O<sub>2</sub>, HNO<sub>3</sub>, H<sub>2</sub>SO<sub>4</sub>, citric acid) favors the formation of acidic functional groups (e.g., carboxylic, phenolic) on biochar surfaces <sup>28, 93, 94</sup>. Although wet-dry and freeze-thaw cycles can 316 317 also introduce oxygen-containing functional groups, these are much weaker in the context of biochar 318 acidification <sup>38</sup>. Limited evidence has shown that biological aging can increase or decrease biochar 319 pH levels. Decreased pH levels may owe to the same reasons discussed above <sup>77</sup>. Increased pH levels 320 may stem from microbial activity, with one study reporting that the pH of a hydrochar increased from 321 a relatively low initial pH level of 4.18 to 6.92 due to microbial decomposition of organic acids <sup>29</sup>. 322 The acidification effect is usually an unwanted phenomenon in field applications. The decrease in soil 323 pH as a result of biochar acidification will be detrimental to plant growth (Section 5.1), and mobilize 324 metallic cations (Section 5.2). Furthermore, acidification may be associated with stimulated GHG 325 emissions (Section 5.3).

The ash content of biochar relates to the inorganic mineral components <sup>24</sup>. Natural aging in the field favors the adsorption of soil minerals onto biochar surfaces, resulting in higher ash content (i.e., ash<sub>aged</sub>/ash<sub>fresh</sub> > 1). Conversely, chemical aging can cause the dissolution of biochar minerals during oxidation (i.e.,  $ash_{aged}/ash_{fresh} < 1$ ). Physical and biological aging, such as wet-dry or freeze-thaw cycles, can either increase or decrease biochar ash contents because of alternating dissolution and precipitation processes, with the resulting ash content depending on the balance of these processes ( $ash_{aged}/ash_{fresh}$  is typically 0.64 – 1.65). It is noteworthy that while physical aging does not usually

### Page 19

affect biochar pH levels significantly, the ash content of physically aged biochar may vary greatly
from that of fresh biochar. On the one hand, the higher ash content of naturally field aged biochars
indicate the presence of more inorganic nutrients (e.g., K, Ca, Na, Mg) within the charosphere <sup>48, 95</sup>.
On the other hand, the de-ashing effect as a result of chemical aging may weaken the co-precipitation
immobilization performance towards soil metals (Section 5.2).

Aging significantly affects the presence of biochar surface functional groups and elemental composition. Both natural and artificial aging approaches can introduce oxygen-containing functional groups, such as hydroxyl, carbonyl and carboxyl, onto biochar surfaces. This is evidenced by Fourier Transform Infrared Spectroscopy (FT-IR) and X-ray Photoelectron Spectroscopy (XPS) observations 52, 89, 93, 96-98. As for the elemental composition, a decrease in C content and increase in O content is typically observed as biochar ages, indicating the dissolution of labile C and the formation of Ocontaining functional groups <sup>38, 51, 99</sup>.

345 Compared with natural aging, artificial aging approaches can lead to significantly higher O:C ratios 346 due to over oxidation (Figure 3c). Common chemical oxidation aging methods involve the use of 347 HNO<sub>3</sub> and H<sub>2</sub>SO<sub>4</sub>, which can raise the O:C ratio to as much as twice that of natural aging. Freeze-348 thaw cycles tend to cause greater increases to the O:C ratio than wet-dry cycles (Figure 3c, average 349 O:C ratio 1:4.1 vs 1:3.3) due to the joint effects of physical fragmentation and the presence of 350 temperature-tolerant microorganisms (e.g., Chryseobacterium, Enterococcus, Pseudomonas) which use biochar labile carbon as a C source during freeze-thaw cycles <sup>100, 101</sup>. These microorganisms are 351 killed by oven drying in wet-dry cycles <sup>102, 103</sup>. In general, artificial aging with LMWOAs presents the 352 353 closest elemental composition to that of natural aging, followed by wet-dry cycling, biological aging, 354 and last of all, chemical oxidation.

355 On the one hand, chemical oxidation fails to simulate natural aging (Figure 3c). On the other hand, 356 the phenomenon of over-oxidation can be used to produce engineered biochars (rich in oxygen 357 content) (Figure 3d). Chemical acidification with HNO<sub>3</sub>/H<sub>2</sub>SO<sub>4</sub> is the most effective way to increase 358 O content, whilst mild oxidation with root exudates (LMWOAs) has little effect on biochar oxidation 359 (Figure 3d). Biochar oxidation is usually accompanied by carbon loss due to mineralization (oxidize 360 to CO<sub>2</sub>) (Figure 3d), but LMWOAs modification will not decrease C content (due to sorption of 361 organic acids on biochar surface). To synthesize engineered biochars, it is suggested that 1) 362 LMOWAs-induced aging can improve soil fertility, since the organic acids act as labile carbon forms 363 that can be easily used by plants and rhizosphere microorganisms; 2) harsh oxidant-modified biochars 364 can be used for contaminant sorption and immobilization due to enhanced surface complexation 365 (Section 5.2).

The atomic H:C ratio is often regarded as an indicator for biochar's carbon compound aromaticity, with high ratios associated with low aromaticity 52, 104. Chemical oxidation and acidification with H<sub>2</sub>O<sub>2</sub>, HNO<sub>3</sub> and H<sub>2</sub>SO<sub>4</sub> can increase aromaticity through dissolution of labile aliphatic carbon, while wet-dry and freeze-thaw cycles usually cause little change to biochar aromaticity (**Figure 3c**). In general, chemical modification with LMWOAs renders the closest H:C ratio changes compared to natural aging, while the use of harsh oxidants such as H<sub>2</sub>O<sub>2</sub>, NaClO, HNO<sub>3</sub> and H<sub>2</sub>SO<sub>4</sub> can lead to severe over-oxidation and inaccurate representation of natural aging (**Figure 3c**).

Cation exchange capacity (CEC) is a measure of biochar's ability to hold positively charged ions, including nutrients or soil contaminants. It also serves as a way to measure biochar oxidation, with greater sensitivity than the O:C ratio <sup>77</sup>. For example, an aging induced change from phenol to ketone groups will not alter the O:C ratio, but will increase the CEC value <sup>77, 105</sup>. In general, aged biochars

377 usually display higher CEC values than fresh biochars, which can be attributed to surface oxidation

378 <sup>52, 77, 106, 107</sup>. One study reported a CEC decrease after aging (from 19.8 to 1.1 cmol/kg) <sup>108</sup>.

379 The anion exchange capacity (AEC) is also an important measurement. The AEC value relates to 380 the nutrient retention capability of biochar and its capacity for anionic contaminant sorption <sup>109, 110</sup>. 381 Anion exchange sites include oxonium groups (sp<sup>2</sup>-O heterocycles), protons electrostatically 382 adsorbed by  $\pi$ -electrons of aromatic rings, and protonated pyridimium groups (N heterocycles) 383 (Figure S3) <sup>110</sup>. Decreased AEC values have been observed for biochar after natural aging and after 384 artificial aging with NaOH/H<sub>2</sub>O<sub>2</sub>. A drop in the AEC value may stem from the loss of formal charge 385 on O<sup>+</sup> as a result of oxonium reduction to ether induced by hydroxyl radical <sup>108</sup>. While a decrease in 386 biochar pH would not necessarily affect oxonium groups, it may increase the positive charge density 387 of N heterocycles, and, therefore, release more protons for electrostatic adsorption <sup>108</sup>. An increase in 388 biochar CEC with aging promotes soil fertility in the long run (Section 5.1). An elevation in CEC is helpful for the retention of metallic cations (such as copper <sup>111</sup>, zinc <sup>112</sup>, cadmium <sup>113</sup> and lead <sup>114</sup>), 389 390 while the decrease in AEC will not be favorable for the immobilization of oxyanions (such as arsenic 391  $^{115}$  and chromium  $^{116}$ ).

392 At the molecular level, biochar can change significantly due to aging processes (Figure S4)  $^{52}$ . For 393 example, aromatic moieties can become disconnected due to the degradation of the labile aliphatic 394 chains that connect them <sup>52</sup>. These aromatic rings will be oxidized, and O-containing functional 395 groups (e.g., hydroxyl, carboxyl, carbonyl) will form on the biochar surface (resulting in increased 396 O/C ratio). With progressive aging, aromatic moieties can fragment into smaller compounds with 397 benzene polycarboxylic acids (BPCAs) eventually forming <sup>117-119</sup>. The full transformation of large 398 aromatic moieties into small BPCAs may take hundreds to thousands of years. In Amazonian Terra 399 Preta soils, biochar produced ~800 years ago has been discovered to now be mainly composed of ~6

400 fused benzene rings substituted by carboxyl groups with negative charges (COO<sup>-</sup>) <sup>52, 120</sup>. In extreme 401 cases, molecular benzene ring with six carboxyl groups will form (B6CA), which will take a very 402 long time (i.e., > 1000 years) <sup>52, 120</sup>. For more information regarding the carbon chemistry of aged 403 biochars, we refer readers to Mia et al. <sup>52</sup>.

404 It is noteworthy that the biomass feedstock, pyrolysis conditions and field characteristics will affect 405 the aging process. A detailed discussion on how these factors influence biochar aging and 406 environmental applications is provided in **Text S1** and **Table S1**.

# 407 **4 ASSESSMENT**

Several *in situ* monitoring studies can provide good evidence regarding biochar's temporal evolution within the soil environment. However, because of time constraints, researchers have more commonly attempted artificial aging methods as a proxy for natural aging, thus cutting the study duration (**Table S4**). Natural and artificial aging methods are discussed in the sub-sections below.

### 412 4.1 Natural aging methods

413 Long-term *in situ* field aging is the most direct way to observe biochar aging. Recovering biochar 414 particles from the field, by hand-picking or the use of physical separation methods, allows the aged 415 biochar properties to be assessed. Among the literature reviewed, the longest field trial duration was 416 9.5 years (Table S4). Such field trials, however, are few and far between due to impracticalities of 417 such studies. Researchers often prefer to incubate biochar-soil mixtures in pot-based studies with 418 constant moisture and humidity. However, pot studies cannot accurately simulate outdoor factors such 419 as rainfall, temperature variance, sunlight. An alternative approach for studying long-term aging 420 effects is to collect biochar that was produced by known historic natural events such as wildfires <sup>121</sup> 421 or at former kiln sites <sup>122</sup>.

### 422 4.2 Artificial aging methods

423 Considering the fact that natural aging is a slow process, artificial aging methods, such as physical 424 aging (e.g., freeze-thaw, wetting-drying), chemical aging (e.g., chemical oxidation, organic acid 425 modification) and biological aging (e.g., co-composting) have emerged as alternatives to natural 426 biochar aging (**Table S4**). These methods help shorten the aging duration from years to months or 427 days.

### 428 **4.2.1 Physical aging**

Temperature and moisture are important factors in physical aging <sup>51, 123, 124</sup>. For example, in middleto-high latitude regions, freeze-thaw cycles can leads to the disintegration of biochar-soil aggregates and the release of dissolved organic matter (DOM), thus affecting soil metal leaching and nutrient

### Page 24

432 transformation <sup>25, 123</sup>. Two common physical aging methods that are used to simulate the aging effects
433 of temperature and humidity are freeze-thaw cycling and wet-dry cycling.

In freeze-thaw cycling studies, selected freezing temperatures range from -70 °C to -15 °C (**Table S4**). While the use of extremely low temperatures may accelerate the aging process, higher freezing temperatures are usually adopted in order to better represent the natural environment. Wet-dry cycles are known to cause cracking on biochar surfaces, thus leading to changed pore structure <sup>124, 125</sup>. This cracking, however, may be an artifact of oven-drying at high temperature (i.e., up to 60 °C). Moreover, freeze-thaw and wet-dry aging methods may not be as representative as chemical and biological aging at mimicking natural aging processes <sup>126</sup>.

### 441 **4.2.2** Chemical aging

Three common approaches that are used to accelerate chemical aging are chemical oxidation, organic acid-induced aging, and photocatalytic oxidation. These methods simulate the effects of inorganic ions, root exudates, and sunlight irradiation on biochar, respectively. One study has also put forward a mineral aging method to assess the effects of clay minerals on biochar physicochemical properties <sup>42</sup>.

Peroxide  $(H_2O_2)$  is a widely used oxidant for simulating natural oxidation processes in biochar aging studies <sup>126</sup>. The use of nitric acid (HNO<sub>3</sub>) or sulfuric acid (H<sub>2</sub>SO<sub>4</sub>) should generally be avoided to prevent exogenous elements being introduced (e.g., N from HNO<sub>3</sub>, S from H<sub>2</sub>SO<sub>4</sub>) <sup>126</sup>. However, these substances can be used to simulate acid rain, since the major anions in acid rain are NO<sub>3</sub><sup>-</sup> and SO<sub>4</sub><sup>2-74</sup>. NaOH/H<sub>2</sub>O<sub>2</sub> can be used to simulate oxidation reactions in saline-alkali soils <sup>127</sup>. Organic acids, such as citric acid, malic acid and ethanoic acid, can be used to simulate the role of plant root exudates in biochar aging <sup>28</sup>. Carboxylic groups and the ionizing protons of low molecular weight 454 organic acids (LMWOAs) can dissolve minerals in the rhizosphere <sup>35, 128</sup>. This deashing process may
 455 improve the pore structure of biochar by clearing pores that are blocked with Ca-, Al-, or Fe- minerals
 456 <sup>28, 129</sup>.

457 On the basis of organic acid-induced aging, a novel photocatalytic aging method was recently 458 proposed. Under UV irradiation, hydroxyl radicals ( $\cdot$ OH) with the presence of LMWOAs (e.g., citric 459 acid, H<sub>3</sub>Cit) act as the dominant mechanism for biochar degradation and subsequent dissolved organic 460 matter (DOM) release (Eq. 3-6)<sup>27</sup>:

461 
$$H_3Cit + O_2 + hv \rightarrow H_3Cit \cdot + O_2 \cdot - (3)$$

$$H^{+} + O_2 \cdot \stackrel{-}{\Rightarrow} HO_2 \cdot \tag{4}$$

$$463 \qquad \qquad 2HO_2 \cdot \rightarrow H_2O_2 + O_2 \tag{5}$$

464 
$$H_2O_2 + h\nu \rightarrow 2 \cdot OH \quad (\lambda < 300 \text{ nm}) \quad (6)$$

465 Considering that Fe is the fourth most abundant element in soil, ferric iron and  $\alpha$ -Fe<sub>2</sub>O<sub>3</sub> may also 466 be added to the citric acid solution with biochar, which accelerates the generation of  $\cdot$ OH through a 467 Fenton reaction.

### 468 **4.2.3 Biological aging**

Microorganisms and plants play important roles for biochar aging. Co-composting and anaerobic fermentation are relatively quick methods (e.g., several weeks) to observe microbial degradation effects <sup>29, 86</sup>. However, the microbial communities in these systems are quite different from those found in natural soil environments. Another feasible biological aging method is to culture and enumerate soil microorganisms and apply them directly to biochar surfaces. In one study, for example,

biochar was exposed to a microbial inoculum that had been extracted from soil after a period of
incubation <sup>77</sup>.

Although mixing biochar with organic acids can mimic the effect of plant exudates on biochar properties, this chemical aging method overlooks the more complex role of rhizobacteria in biochar aging. Growing plants in biochar amended soils may be a better aging approach in this sense, but it can take months or years to accomplish the aging process <sup>130, 131</sup>.

# 480 5 IMPLICATIONS

### 481 **5.1 Soil Fertility**

482 Long-term aging of biochar improves soil fertility from physical, chemical, and biological aspects. 483 Firstly, an increase in surface hydrophilicity as a result of oxidation leads to enhanced water retention 484 for aged biochars <sup>132, 133</sup>. For instance, six months of field aging promoted the water retention of rice 485 husk biochar amended soils, as confirmed by the increase of plant available water content by 20% 486 during the second growing season of wheat compared with the soils in the first growing season <sup>134</sup>. 487 Aggregate stability is the key factor in terms of soil physical fertility. High stability of soil aggregates 488 indicates the preservation of soil physical structure for gas exchange, microbial colonization, 489 germination and rooting of cultivated plants <sup>135-137</sup>. Long-term soil aggregate stability improvement 490 has also been observed after biochar field application. For instance, 3-year application of straw 491 biochar to a Planosol increased the proportion of stable aggregates by 92% compared with the 492 unamended soil <sup>138</sup>. It has been acknowledged that the initial biochar application would elevate soil 493 EC via a considerable input of soluble salts <sup>139, 140</sup>, thus favoring the aggregation of soil colloids 494 through double layer suppression <sup>141, 142</sup>. In the long run, however, other aggregation mechanisms,

such as excretion of mucilage and the attachment of hyphae by colonized bacteria and fungi, would
sustain the soil aggregate sustainability despite the leaching of soluble salts <sup>138, 143, 144</sup>.

497 The gradual increase in CEC during aging (Section 3.2) promotes soil fertility chemically. An increased retention of cationic nutrients, such as Mg<sup>2+</sup>, K<sup>+</sup>, and Ca<sup>2+</sup>, has been observed in many 498 499 biochar amended soils that have undergone aging over time <sup>52, 145, 146</sup>. The extremely high fertility for 500 anthropogenic charcoal-rich soils are mainly explained by the increase of CEC during natural aging <sup>52, 117, 147</sup>. For instance, the CEC value of the anthropogenic soils collected from an archaeological site 501 502 in Brazil was nearly 4 times that of the adjacent soils (i.e., 222 cmol/kg vs 59 cmol/kg)<sup>147</sup>. Mild 503 oxidation results in an increase of oxygen-containing functional groups, thus increasing the surface 504 charge density of aged biochars. The adsorption of dissolved organic carbon also contributes to CEC 505 elevation <sup>52, 147</sup>. Furthermore, the dissolution of biochar minerals can be a source of plant nutrients 506 and increase soil fertility directly (Section 2.1)<sup>148</sup>.

507 Current studies suggest that long-term biochar application could also improve soil health via 508 increasing the diversity of soil microorganisms, which is possibly due to the aforementioned 509 improvement in soil physical and chemical conditions. The alpha diversity (i.e., the Chao 1 index) of 510 wheat straw biochar amended soils increased by 27% compared with the unamended soils after 6 511 years of long-term aging. This is because the formation of stable macroaggregates created an ideal 512 habitat for microbial colonization <sup>149</sup>. A recent meta-analysis also suggest that the microbial diversity 513 tend to increase with biochar aging <sup>150</sup>. One study even observed the colonization of plant-growth 514 promoting bacteria (PGPBs) strains (formation of biofilms) after 3-year field aging of poplar biochars. 515 High levels of indole-3-acetic acid (IAA), a typical phytohormone, can be produced (up to 94 mg/L), 516 suggesting a strong plant growth promoting effect <sup>44</sup>.

#### Page 28

### 517 5.2 Soil remediation

518 Aging may either increase or decrease biochar's capacity to sorb heavy metals and organic 519 contaminants (Table S5). Generally, chemically or biologically oxidized biochars tend to adsorb 520 greater amounts of heavy metals due to enhanced surface complexation between metals and Ocontaining functional groups <sup>27, 29, 93, 151</sup>. Naturally aged biochars tend to have improved metal 521 522 adsorption capacity because mild oxidation retains the biochar ash content, thus facilitating 523 contaminant co-precipitation (Figure 3b). In comparison, physically aged biochars tend to display 524 decreased adsorption capacity, primarily because they possess low amount of O-containing functional 525 groups and inorganic minerals are washed off during freeze-thaw or wet-dry cycles, thus leading to 526 diminished co-precipitation capability <sup>38, 93, 152</sup>. The adsorption capacity of chemically aged biochars 527 is highly dependent on the biochar carbon chemistry. For example, if the proportion of recalcitrant C 528 is high, the enhanced surface complexation adsorption due to the addition of O-containing functional 529 groups may be counteracted by decreased contaminant co-precipitation due the removal of minerals. 530 Biologically aged biochars may display increased adsorption capacity due to mild oxidation, but this 531 can be counteracted by microbial layers on the biochar surface that block available adsorption sites.

Biochar aging in the field may have diverse influences on metal immobilization performance. Several studies have reported concerns that biochar did not stabilize heavy metals in the long-term. For instance, artificial wet-dry aging showed biochar failed to immobilize soil Cu and Pb for 14 aging cycles (p > 0.05) <sup>153</sup>. However, other studies have suggested that aged biochar may favor long-term metal stabilization due to the increased number of O-containing functional groups leading to greater surface complexation (Eq. 7-8) <sup>154, 155</sup>

538 
$$\equiv XOH^0 + M^{2+} = \equiv XOM^+ + H^+$$
 (7)

#### Page 29

539 
$$\equiv XOH^0 + M^{2+} = \equiv XOHM^{2+}$$
 (8)

540 where  $\equiv XOH^0$  represents the surface O-containing functional groups,  $M^{2+}$  represents the divalent 541 metal cations.

542 Contradicting findings in different studies may owe to the counter effects of O-containing 543 functional group-assisted immobilization and dissolved organic matter (DOM)-induced mobilization 544 <sup>131, 156</sup>. In a 3-year field study, for example, Cd and Cu contaminated soils were stabilized in the long-545 term by corn straw-derived biochar, while the performance of hardwood-derived biochar reduced 546 after the second year <sup>157</sup>. This finding was attributed to the fact that hardwood biochar contains more 547 recalcitrant C which resists oxidation aging. The addition of O-containing functional groups on the 548 hardwood biochar was discovered to be minimal compared to the corn straw biochars.

The addition of O-containing functional groups during biochar aging may affect organic contaminant adsorption in various ways. Firstly, these functional groups increase the hydrophilicity of the biochar surface, forming water clusters through hydrogen bonding. These clusters may prevent hydrophobic contaminants (e.g., naphthalene, paraquat, phthalates) from approaching the biochar surface <sup>70, 158</sup>. Secondly, O-containing functional groups may promote  $\pi$ - $\pi$  EDA interactions because of increased  $\pi$ -polarity in biochar aromatic rings <sup>158, 159</sup>. Any shift in organic contaminant adsorption capacity with biochar aging is the combined effect of these two mechanisms.

556 Ghaffar et al. <sup>158</sup> has found that the  $\pi$ - $\pi$  EDA interactions overcompensated the inhibiting effects of 557 water clusters, resulting in higher adsorption capacity towards diethyl phthalate (68.2 mg/g vs 36.3 558 mg/g) and dibutyl phthalate (216.1 mg/g vs 136.0 mg/g) for chemically oxidized low temperature 559 biochar (pyrolysis temperature 300 °C). Similarly, Shi et al. <sup>70</sup> noticed that naturally aging resulted in 560 a substantial increase in herbicide paraquat adsorption capacity (from 1.7 µmol/g to 5.3 µmol/g) for

biochar pyrolyzed at a low temperature (i.e., 300 °C). However, the adsorption capacity decreased (from 84.1  $\mu$ mol/g to 72.0  $\mu$ mol/g) for biochars produced at a much higher temperature (i.e., 600 °C). This effect may be explained by the different carbon chemistry of biochars produced at different temperature. Low-temperature biochars possess more labile C, while higher-temperature chars have more graphite-sheet structures with high  $\pi$ -electron density (**Text S1**, **Table S1**) <sup>9, 160</sup>. Therefore, oxygenation of high-temperature biochar may not cause a significant drop in  $\pi$ -electron density to support the presence of  $\pi$ - $\pi$  EDA interactions <sup>159</sup>.

568 Current findings suggest that biochar aging may not favor the immobilization of organic 569 contaminants. Decreased physical adsorption due to blockage of pore, inhibited hydrophobic 570 interactions and the mobilizing effect of soil organic matter (SOM) may account for the diminished 571 stabilization <sup>161, 162</sup>. In one study, the phenranthelene adsorption capacity of a soil amended with pig 572 manure-derived biochar increased after aging <sup>163</sup>. This finding was probably because manure-derived 573 biochar possessed more inorganic minerals (i.e., high ash content) compared with other biochar types 574 <sup>9</sup>. The hydrophilic groups of dissolved organic carbon (DOC) may bind with inorganic minerals (to 575 form cation bridges), while the hydrophobic groups of DOC will be exposed on the outer surface of 576 biochar, thus favoring the hydrophobic interactions. Therefore, aged biochars could adsorb organic 577 contaminants in an indirect way (i.e., contaminant-DOC-cation-biochar)<sup>163</sup>.

It is also noteworthy that biochar aging may favor the microbial degradation of organic contaminants. After microbial colonization on the external and internal surfaces as a result of biological aging (Section 2.4), biochar may act as an electron shuttle between these colonized microorganisms and the organic contaminants. Electrons can be transferred from one microbial cell to the functional groups with an electron-accepting capacity (e.g., quinone). After that, the sp<sup>2</sup>hybridized graphite-like structure of biochar could transport the electron to an electron-donating functional groups (e.g., phenolic hydroxyl), which will be accepted by the target contaminant <sup>164-166</sup>.
With progressive aging, the presence of more oxygen-containing functional groups (Section 3.2) of
biochars may promote this "electron shuttle" effect. Future studies are needed to verify how biochar
would contribute to the adsorption/degradation of organic contaminants in the long run.

588

## 5.3 Climate change mitigation

589 Controversy exists whether biochar field aging can suppress soil greenhouse gas (GHG) emissions 590 (Figure S6). <sup>167</sup>. Evidence from long-term field applications (i.e., >1 year) suggest that biochar can 591 slightly suppress soil CO<sub>2</sub> emissions (reduce CO<sub>2</sub> emissons by 2% on average, compared with the 592 unamended soil) (Figure S6, Table S6). Biochar was the most effective for CO<sub>2</sub> emission mitigation 593 in coarse-textured soils, with significant differences (p < 0.05) between soil CO<sub>2</sub> emission reduction 594 rates for sandy loam and clay loam (Figure S6, Table S6). This is probably because biochar are more 595 likely to form water-stable aggregates in coarse soils <sup>138, 168</sup>, which will protect soil organic matter (SOM) from mineralization <sup>169, 170</sup>. 596

597 A long-term field trial (9.5 years) revealed a negative priming effect within the rhizosphere in soils 598 amended with biochar, which was related to the sorption of root exudates by the biochar, hence 599 minimizing C mineralization through inhibiting the dissolution of SOM. Biochar addition may also 600 enhance organo-mineral interactions which result in C stabilization and, therefore, lower CO<sub>2</sub> 601 emissions (Figure 4). In comparison, a positive priming effect in unamended soil stems from 602 chemically reduced C (i.e., root exudates) stimulating the degradation of SOM and C derived from 603 plant roots, thus leading to C mineralization and CO<sub>2</sub> emissions. In addition, acidic root exudates also 604 lead to the dissolution of mineral-bound organic C, thus increasing the bioavailability of SOM 605 (Figure 4). However, some studies have observed a reverse trend, that long-term biochar application

#### **Environmental Science & Technology**

led to more  $CO_2$  emissions from soil (**Table S6**). This may stem from the rapid colonization of soil microorganisms and biological degradation increased the soil labile organic C pools <sup>171</sup> and accelerated SOC mineralization <sup>172</sup>.

609 Long-term aging can also reduce CH<sub>4</sub> emissions from soils amended with biochar (Table S6). 610 Biochar applied to a paddy field could still reduce CH<sub>4</sub> emissions by 33% even after 4 years of natural 611 aging. Interestingly, a higher application rate (i.e., 20 t/ha vs 5 t/ha) will not be equal to higher  $CH_4$ 612 emission reduction at the initial stage until the second year. With progressive aging, the positive 613 effects of biochar application on soil health, such as the enhanced aeration and colonization of 614 methanotrophs, will be revealed. Another 4-year field study showed that after biochar application, the ratio of methanogens to methanotrophs increased to a peak in the 3<sup>rd</sup> year from 4.4 to 9.4 (calculated 615 616 by the copy number ratios of mcrA to pmoA) and then subsequently decreased to 4.6 in the last year 617 <sup>173</sup>. This temporal pattern was likely associated with biochar aging leading to increased soil porosity 618 and air introduction, which increased the oxidation-reduction potential (Eh) and, thus, reduced the 619 abundance of methanogens.

620 Biochar aging also affects soil N<sub>2</sub>O emissions by influencing microorganism activity associated 621 with nitrification and denitrification. A long-term study of the effects of biochar aging (6 years) on 622 nitrification-denitrification in paddy soil and associated N2/N2O emissions revealed decreased C and 623 N bioavailability, with decreasing amounts of NO<sub>3</sub><sup>-</sup> reduction and total N emissions recorded. After 624 aging for 6 years, the labile C forms in the biochar decreased substantially, while the remaining 625 recalcitrant C forms could not be utilized by most denitrifying microbes <sup>174</sup>. Another study reported 626 the reverse trend, revealing that biochar aging stimulated N<sub>2</sub>O emission by 43% in alkaline soils and 627 by 78% in acid soil <sup>175</sup>. The enhanced nitrification and denitrification were the main reason for this 628 stimulation.

The underlying mechanisms involved in suppression or stimulation of GHG emission with biochar aging have not yet been fully addressed. The linkages between biochar characteristics, soil properties, and microbial communities on C and N transformation rates should be further explored. In particular, more field studies should be conducted to explore the roles of soil aggregation, microbial colonization, organic acid and mineral adsorption in GHG emission regulation in-depth.

634



Figure 4. Proposed mechanisms for positive rhizosphere priming of soil organic carbon (SOC)
counteracted by biochar-induced negative priming and stabilization of rhizodeposits in a ferralsol
after 9.5 years. Reproduced with permission from Han Weng et al. <sup>167</sup>. Copyright 2017 Springer
Nature.

### 640 6 FINAL CONSIDERATIONS

### 641 6.1 Risks associated with biochar aging

642 Biochar aging can lead to an acidification effect, which may mobilize soil metals and increase their 643 bioavailability to soil organisms and plants (Figure 3b). For instance, although fresh biochar 644 application can reduce Al<sup>3+</sup> uptake to plant tissues in acidic soils through a "liming" effect, biochar 645 acidification due to long-term field aging could increase the exchangeable aluminum fraction <sup>176</sup>. Root 646 exudates (consisting of LMWOAs) which facilitate the dissolution of biochar nutrients (e.g.,  $K_2Ca(SO_4)_2$ ,  $K_2Mg(PO_3)_4$ , CaCO<sub>3</sub>), may also facilitate the mobilization of potentially toxic elements, 647 648 due to the dissolution of Al- and Pb-containing minerals (e.g., Al(H<sub>2</sub>PO<sub>4</sub>)<sub>3</sub>, AlPO<sub>4</sub>, Pb<sub>2</sub>(SO<sub>4</sub>)O, Pb<sub>2</sub>P<sub>2</sub>O<sub>7</sub>)<sup>28</sup>. Biochar aging may also increase the release of DOC leading to nutrient loss and metal 649 650 mobilization.

Recent studies have shown that aging could increase the mobility of small (colloidal) biochar particles in the subsurface, leading to nutrient loss and contaminant migration in biochar amended soils. It has been suggested that biochar aging can decrease biochar hydrophobicity and shift the Gibbs free energy from negative to positive <sup>94</sup>. This indicates that Lewis acid-base interactions between biochar colloids and soil would shift from attractive to repulsive (i.e., hydration force) thus enhancing biochar particle migration. Therefore, aged biochar may pose a risk to groundwater, since heavy

metals, herbicides, microplastics and even pathogens (e.g., bacteria and viruses) may transport with
 biochar colloids <sup>177, 178</sup>.

### 659 6.2 A framework for long-term field applications

660 To better comprehend the role of long-term biochar field application in sustainable agriculture, a 661 DPSIR (driving forces – pressures – status – impacts – responses) framework is proposed (Figure 5). 662 Although DPSIR has been commonly used to describe the interactions between society and the 663 environment, extrapolating this framework to biochar field application can help better understand the 664 interrelationships between aging-induced changes and soil fertility, remediation, and climate change 665 mitigation. Firstly, the demand on producing more crops and remediating contaminated soils are the 666 drivers for biochar application in the field (drivers). After biochar addition, various natural forces, 667 such as natural oxidation, microbial metabolism, and rainfall events lead to changes in biochar 668 physicochemical properties (pressures). Consequently, biochar will be oxidized and acidified, and 669 more O-containing functional groups will be introduced onto its surface. Furthermore, biological 670 aging of biochar may form a microbial layer, blocking the pores structure (status).

671 Biochar aging can either positively or negatively affect sustainable agriculture. On the one hand, 672 biochar aging delivers sustained slow release of nutrients that promote soil fertility in the long run. 673 Enhanced surface complexation also favors the long-term immobilization of potentially toxic soil 674 metals. Importantly, biochar aging can decrease GHG emissions due to a negative priming effect and 675 changed abundance of methanogens and methanotrophs. On the other hand, long-term biochar aging 676 may cause acidification which increases the mobility of potentially toxic soil metals. It has also been 677 suggested that biochar aging can enhance biochar particle migration and facilitate the transport of 678 herbicides and other potentially harmful substances (impacts).

To meet the growing demand for increased crop production, soil remediation and climate change mitigation, chemical pre-application aging treatment may offer a feasible approach to improved performance (response 1). To better understand the mechanisms associated with long-term aging of biochar, monitoring of biochar amended soils is necessary (response 2). To predict aging-induced changes in biochar properties, developing quantitative accelerated aging tests is needed (response 3).



684

685 Figure 5. A DPSIR framework for long-term biochar applications. Chemical pre-application aging 686 treatment (pre-aging), long-term monitoring and prediction using quantitative artificial aging 687 approaches can be regarded as responses to the driving forces, pressures and the states, respectively. 688 To meet the demand on crop production, soil remediation and climate change mitigation, chemical 689 pre-application aging treatment can act as an effective tool to produce engineered biochars with 690 excellent performances (i.e., contaminant immobilization, fertility improvement and GHG 691 mitigation). To better understand the mechanisms associated with long-term aging of biochar, 692 monitoring of biochar amended soils is necessary. To predict aging-induced changes in biochar 693 properties, developing quantitative accelerated aging tests in the laboratory is a feasible way.

### Page 37

### 694 6.3 Current challenges and future perspective

Long-term monitoring of biochar-amended soils provides direct evidence on how this soil amendment changes with time. However, due to the time constraints, more studies have developed artificial aging methods as proxies. Existing methods have mainly focused on single aging mechanisms, meaning that they do not represent the complex natural conditions of the real world. Moreover, chemical aging with oxidants tends to cause over-oxidation compared to natural aging, especially when strong oxidants are used. Furthermore, exogenous elements may be introduced to the biochar from certain chemicals (e.g., N from HNO<sub>3</sub>, S from H<sub>2</sub>SO<sub>4</sub>) <sup>126</sup>.

The effects of artificial physical aging are limited to only the biochar porous structure with no significant changes to the ultimate properties. The freezing temperature selected for freeze-thaw cycling can be unrealistic low (e.g., below -20 °C). In addition, the drying part of wet-dry cycles usually involves higher temperatures (e.g., 60 °C) than that typically occur in nature, leading to biochar cracking. While biological aging may be much milder than chemical oxidation, the microorganisms used may follow different metabolism pathways (e.g., co-composting) than a soil microbiome.

Since natural aging is a complex process that involves simultaneous physical, chemical and biological aging mechanisms, future studies ought to develop multifaceted advanced aging methods that combine different mechanisms. New methods could be programed to have variable aging stresses with time. For example, wet–dry and freeze–thaw cycling could be conducted with variable temperatures, frequencies, precipitation levels, and freeze periods. Climate change predictions could be applied to aging methods in order to determine biochar's resilience <sup>179</sup>. When it comes to the selection of chemical oxidation agents, we recommend that mild natural oxidants are used (e.g., citric
acid, malic acid as root exudates).

717 Field monitoring is very important to timely assess the function of biochar. It is suggested to carry 718 out periodically sampling and analysis to verify the performance of biochar in fertility improvement, 719 contaminant remediation and GHG emissions mitigation. In-situ wireless sensors detecting the 720 moisture content, pH, Eh, and conductivity of biochar-amended soils can be used to provide real-time 721 monitoring and help assess the potential environmental impacts on biochar. In addition, advanced 722 characterization technologies could be coupled with long-term monitoring to provide a timely "health 723 assessment" of biochar and the amended soil. For example, stable isotope analysis can reveal the 724 nutrient cycling and GHG mitigation mechanisms of the biochar-amended soils. X-ray absorption 725 fine spectra can reveal the speciation of elements, including biochar carbon chemistry and the 726 chemical composition of the adsorbed contaminants, therefore suggesting the effectiveness of 727 environmental remediation in the long-run.

Since biochar can remain stable for hundreds to thousands of years, it is not possible to conduct field trials that cover the whole natural aging process. Sometimes applying fresh biochar to a certain field and monitor for dozens of years may also be difficult due to various reasons including the cost, land-use regulations, natural disasters, etc. Yet it is possible to monitor the aging process using chrono-sequence approaches, that is, to collect data from different biochar-amended sites with different ages and analyze their aging characteristics using statistical approaches.

Quantitative artificial aging methods in the lab should be applied to make predictions of biochar's
long-term performance. However, only limited attempts have been made at providing quantitative
information from accelerated biochar aging. In some studies, biochar aging caused by natural rainfall

#### Page 39

737 has been quantified through adding calculated amounts of CO<sub>2</sub>-saturated water to biochar amended 738 soils  $^{180, 181}$ . For example, assuming the annual precipitation is 2 m, each 1 g of dry soil (density = 1.3 739 g/cm<sup>3</sup>) would receive 1.538 mL of pH 5.6 rainwater per year. Therefore, it is reasoned that each cycle 740 involving a 1:10 mixture (g/mL) of soil and rainwater simulates 6.5 years of H<sup>+</sup> addition. Another 741 suggested quantitative approach combined wet-dry cycles with freeze-thaw cycles to simulate the 742 different mechanisms of aging <sup>26</sup>. Based on historical precipitation and air temperature data, it was 743 proposed that each complete cycle simulates four months of natural aging. It is evident that such 744 partially quantitative methods may not provide accurate predictions, since many other factors, such 745 as sunlight irradiation, chemical oxidation and microbial metabolism are overlooked. Moreover, 746 verification of laboratory aging studies with representative field data obtained from the long-term 747 monitoring or chrono-sequence analysis is urgently required.

It is also noteworthy that current studies mainly focus on the aging process in terrestrial ecosystems.
However, many successful attempts have shown that biochar can also be applied in aquatic
ecosystems as an amendment for *in situ* sediment remediation <sup>182-185</sup>. Little research, however, has
investigated the long-term aging effect in these systems <sup>186, 187</sup>. Future studies are desperately needed
to explore the aging mechanisms in these aquatic settings.

Artificially pre-aged biochars promise to be more effective for field applications than fresh biochar. In this context, artificial aging acts as a tool to synthesize an engineered biochar product (**Figure S5**). For enhanced contaminant immobilization, harsh oxidants, such as  $H_2O_2$ ,  $H_2SO_4$  and  $HNO_3$  may be an effective aging approach (**Figure 3d**). For soil fertility improvement, modifying biochar with LMWOAs may be more effective. It is suggested that future studies should explore the applicability of pre-aged biochars in field trials.

759

# 760 ASSOCIATED CONTENT

### 761 **Supporting Information:**

762 Text S1. Effects of biomass feedstock, pyrolysis conditions and field characteristics on biochar 763 aging. Table S1. Influencing factors affecting the aging process and environmental implications. Table S2. Aging-induced changes in biochar morphology and associated physico-chemical changes. 764 765 Table S3. Aging induced changes in biochar properties. Table S4. Natural and artificial approaches 766 to biochar aging. Table S5. Contaminant adsorption performances of aged biochars. Table S6. Field 767 evidence for biochar's ability to mitigate GHG emissions in the long run. Figure S1. Evidence of 768 physical fragmentation as an aging mechanism. Figure S2. N<sub>2</sub> adsorption-desorption isotherms of 769 fresh and aged biochars revealing the changes in pore structure. Figure S3, Anion exchange 770 mechanisms for biochars. Figure S4. A molecular understanding of changes in biochar chemical 771 compositions upon aging. Figure S5. Effects of biochar aging on contaminant retention, soil fertility 772 and climate change. Figure S6. Box plots revealing the effects of long-term biochar application on 773 soil CO2 emissions.

774

## 775 **AUTHOR INFORMATION**

- 776 Corresponding author:
- \*E-mail: houdeyi@tsinghua.edu.cn. Phone: +86-010-62781159.
- 778 Notes

The authors declare no competing financial interest.

### 780 ACKNOWLEDGEMENT

This work was supported by the National Key Research and Development Program of China (Grant
No. 2018YFC1801300).

### 783 **REFERENCES**

784

- IBI, Standardized Product Definition and Product Testing Guidelines for Biochar That Is Used
   in Soil. In International Biochar Initiative: 2015.
- Yazdani, M. R.; Duimovich, N.; Tiraferri, A.; Laurell, P.; Borghei, M.; Zimmerman, J. B.;
   Vahala, R., Tailored mesoporous biochar sorbents from pinecone biomass for the adsorption of
   natural organic matter from lake water. *J Mol Liq* 2019, *291*.
- 790 3. Shaheen, S. M.; Niazi, N. K.; Hassan, N. E. E.; Bibi, I.; Wang, H. L.; Tsang, D. C. W.; Ok,
- Y. S.; Bolan, N.; Rinklebe, J., Wood-based biochar for the removal of potentially toxic elements in
  water and wastewater: a critical review. *Int. Mater. Rev.* 2019, *64*, (4), 216-247.
- Wei, G.; Zhang, J.; Luo, J.; Xue, H.; Huang, D.; Cheng, Z.; Jiang, X., Nanoscale zero-valent
  iron supported on biochar for the highly efficient removal of nitrobenzene. *Front. Environ. Sci. Eng.*2019, *13*, (4).
- 796 5. Zhang, K.; Sun, P.; Zhang, Y., Decontamination of Cr(VI) facilitated formation of persistent
  797 free radicals on rice husk derived biochar. *Front. Environ. Sci. Eng.* 2019, *13*, (2).

### Page 42

798	6. Zhang, H.; Wang, T.; Zhang, Y.; Sun, B.; Pan, W. P., Promotional effect of NH3 on mer	cury
799	removal over biochar thorough chlorine functional group transformation. Journal of Cle	eaner
800	<i>Production</i> <b>2020</b> , 257.	

801 7. El-Naggar, A.; Lee, S. S.; Rinklebe, J.; Farooq, M.; Song, H.; Sarmah, A. K.; Zimmerman,
802 A. R.; Ahmad, M.; Shaheen, S. M.; Ok, Y. S., Biochar application to low fertility soils: A review of
803 current status, and future prospects. *Geoderma* 2019, *337*, 536-554.

804 8. El-Naggar, A.; El-Naggar, A. H.; Shaheen, S. M.; Sarkar, B.; Chang, S. X.; Tsang, D. C. W.;
 805 Rinklebe, J.; Ok, Y. S., Biochar composition-dependent impacts on soil nutrient release, carbon
 806 mineralization, and potential environmental risk: A review. *J. Environ. Manage.* 2019, *241*, 458-467.

807 9. Wang, L.; Ok, Y. S.; Tsang, D. C. W.; Alessi, D. S.; Rinklebe, J.; Wang, H.; Mašek, O.; Hou,

808 R.; O'Connor, D.; Hou, D., New Trends in Biochar Pyrolysis and Modification Strategies: Feedstock,

Pyrolysis Conditions, Sustainability Concerns and Implications for Soil Amendment. *Soil Use and Management* 2020, *early access*, 1-29.

811 10. El-Naggar, A.; Shaheen, S. M.; Hseu, Z. Y.; Wang, S. L.; Ok, Y. S.; Rinklebe, J., Release
812 dynamics of As, Co, and Mo in a biochar treated soil under pre-definite redox conditions. *Sci. Total*813 *Environ.* 2019, 657, 686-695.

814 11. Woolf, D.; Amonette, J. E.; Street-Perrott, F. A.; Lehmann, J.; Joseph, S., Sustainable biochar
815 to mitigate global climate change. *Nat. Commun.* 2010, *1*, 9.

816 12. UNEP *Tackling the growing challenge of soil pollution*; United Nations Environment
817 Programme: 2017.

#### Page 43

- 818 13. Hou, D.; Bolan, N. S.; Tsang, D. C. W.; Kirkham, M. B.; O'Connor, D., Sustainable soil use
- 819 and management: An interdisciplinary and systematic approach. *Sci. Total Environ.* 2020, 729.
- 820 14. Hou, D., Sustainable Remediation of Contaminated Soil and Groundwater: Materials,
  821 Processes. and Assessment. Elsevier: 2020.
- 822 15. UNCCD, *The Global Land Outlook (GLO)* Available at:
  823 https://www.unccd.int/actions/global-land-outlook-glo: 2017.
- 16. Lehmann, J.; Da Silva Jr, J. P.; Steiner, C.; Nehls, T.; Zech, W.; Glaser, B., Nutrient
- 825 availability and leaching in an archaeological Anthrosol and a Ferralsol of the Central Amazon basin:
- Fertilizer, manure and charcoal amendments. *Plant Soil* **2003**, *249*, (2), 343-357.
- 827 17. Eden, M. J.; Bray, W.; Herrera, L.; McEwan, C., Terra preta soils and their archaeological
  828 context in the Caquetá Basin of Southeast Colombia. *Am. Antiq.* 1984, *49*, (1), 125-140.
- 829 18. Biederman, L. A.; Harpole, W. S., Biochar and its effects on plant productivity and nutrient
  830 cycling: a meta-analysis. *GCB Bioenergy* 2013, *5*, (2), 202-214.
- Wang, P.; Chen, H.; Kopittke, P. M.; Zhao, F. J., Cadmium contamination in agricultural soils
  of China and the impact on food safety. *Environ. Pollut.* 2019, *249*, 1038-1048.
- Yang, Q.; Li, Z.; Lu, X.; Duan, Q.; Huang, L.; Bi, J., A review of soil heavy metal pollution
  from industrial and agricultural regions in China: Pollution and risk assessment. *Sci. Total Environ.* **2018**, *642*, 690-700.
- 836 21. Chen, R.; Ye, C., Resolving soil pollution in China. *Nature* **2014**, *505*, (7484), 483-483.

837	22.	Ahmad, M.; Rajapaksha, A. U.; Lim, J. E.; Zhang, M.; Bolan, N.; Mohan, D.; Vithanage, M.;
838	Lee, S	S. S.; Ok, Y. S., Biochar as a sorbent for contaminant management in soil and water: A review.
839	Chem	<i>cosphere</i> <b>2014,</b> <i>99</i> , 19-33.

23. O'Connor, D.; Peng, T.; Zhang, J.; Tsang, D. C. W.; Alessi, D. S.; Shen, Z.; Bolan, N. S.; Hou,

841 D., Biochar application for the remediation of heavy metal polluted land: A review of in situ field

842 trials. Sci. Total Environ. 2018, 619-620, 815-826.

24. Palansooriya, K. N.; Shaheen, S. M.; Chen, S. S.; Tsang, D. C. W.; Hashimoto, Y.; Hou, D.;

Bolan, N. S.; Rinklebe, J.; Ok, Y. S., Soil amendments for immobilization of potentially toxic
elements in contaminated soils: A critical review. *Environ. Int.* 2020, *134*.

- Fu, Q.; Zhao, H.; Li, T.; Hou, R.; Liu, D.; Ji, Y.; Zhou, Z.; Yang, L., Effects of biochar addition
  on soil hydraulic properties before and after freezing-thawing. *Catena* 2019, *176*, 112-124.
- Meng, Z.; Huang, S.; Xu, T.; Deng, Y.; Lin, Z.; Wang, X., Transport and transformation of
  Cd between biochar and soil under combined dry-wet and freeze-thaw aging. *Environ. Pollut.* 2020, *263.*

Quan, G.; Fan, Q.; Cui, L.; Zimmerman, A. R.; Wang, H.; Zhu, Z.; Gao, B.; Wu, L.; Yan, J.,
Simulated photocatalytic aging of biochar in soil ecosystem: Insight into organic carbon release,
surface physicochemical properties and cadmium sorption. *Environ. Res.* 2020, *183*.

Liu, G.; Chen, L.; Jiang, Z.; Zheng, H.; Dai, Y.; Luo, X.; Wang, Z., Aging impacts of low
molecular weight organic acids (LMWOAs) on furfural production residue-derived biochars:
Porosity, functional properties, and inorganic minerals. *Sci. Total Environ.* 2017, *607-608*, 1428-1436.

### Page 45

857	29. Hua, Y.; Zheng, X.; Xue, L.; Han, L.; He, S.; Mishra, T.; Feng, Y.; Yang, L.; Xing, B.,
858	Microbial aging of hydrochar as a way to increase cadmium ion adsorption capacity: Process and
859	mechanism. Bioresour. Technol. 2020, 300.

Spokas, K. A., Review of the stability of biochar in soils: Predictability of O:C molar ratios. *Carbon Manage.* 2010, *1*, (2), 289-303.

862 31. Silber, A.; Levkovitch, I.; Graber, E. R., PH-dependent mineral release and surface properties
863 of cornstraw biochar: Agronomic implications. *Environ. Sci. Technol.* 2010, *44*, (24), 9318-9323.

864 32. Limwikran, T.; Kheoruenromne, I.; Suddhiprakarn, A.; Prakongkep, N.; Gilkes, R. J.,

B65 Dissolution of K, Ca, and P from biochar grains in tropical soils. *Geoderma* **2018**, *312*, 139-150.

866 33. US EPA What is Acid Rain? Retrieved from <u>https://www.epa.gov/acidrain/what-acid-rain</u>.

34. Zheng, H.; Zhang, Q.; Liu, G.; Luo, X.; Li, F.; Zhang, Y.; Wang, Z., Characteristics and
mechanisms of chlorpyrifos and chlorpyrifos-methyl adsorption onto biochars: Influence of deashing
and low molecular weight organic acid (LMWOA) aging and co-existence. *Sci. Total Environ.* 2019,
657, 953-962.

35. Jones, D. L., Organic acids in the rhizosphere - A critical review. *Plant Soil* 1998, 205, (1),
25-44.

Mimmo, T.; Del Buono, D.; Terzano, R.; Tomasi, N.; Vigani, G.; Crecchio, C.; Pinton, R.;
Zocchi, G.; Cesco, S., Rhizospheric organic compounds in the soil-microorganism-plant system:
Their role in iron availability. *Eur. J. Soil Sci.* 2014, *65*, (5), 629-642.

876	37.	Spokas, K. A.; Novak, J. M.; Masiello, C. A.; Johnson, M. G.; Colosky, E. C.; Ippolito, J. A.;
877	Trigo,	C., Physical Disintegration of Biochar: An Overlooked Process. Environ. Sci. Techno. Lett.
878	2014, 1	<i>I</i> , (8), 326-332.

879 38. Tan, L.; Ma, Z.; Yang, K.; Cui, Q.; Wang, K.; Wang, T.; Wu, G. L.; Zheng, J., Effect of three 880 artificial aging techniques on physicochemical properties and Pb adsorption capacities of different 881 biochars. Sci. Total Environ. 2020, 699.

- 39. 882 Gao, X.; Wu, H., Aerodynamic Properties of Biochar Particles: Effect of Grinding and 883 Implications. Environ. Sci. Techno. Lett. 2013, 1, (1), 60-64.
- 884 40. Lin, Y.; Munroe, P.; Joseph, S.; Kimber, S.; Van Zwieten, L., Nanoscale organo-mineral 885 reactions of biochars in ferrosol: An investigation using microscopy. Plant Soil 2012, 357, (1-2), 369-886 380.
- 887 41. Nguyen, B. T.; Lehmann, J.; Kinyangi, J.; Smernik, R.; Riha, S. J.; Engelhard, M. H., Long-888 term black carbon dynamics in cultivated soil. *Biogeochemistry* **2008**, *89*, (3), 295-308.
- 889 42. Ren, X.; Wang, F.; Zhang, P.; Guo, J.; Sun, H., Aging effect of minerals on biochar properties 890 and sorption capacities for atrazine and phenanthrene. Chemosphere 2018, 206, 51-58.
- 891 Yang, F.; Zhao, L.; Gao, B.; Xu, X.; Cao, X., The Interfacial Behavior between Biochar and 43. 892 Soil Minerals and Its Effect on Biochar Stability. Environ. Sci. Technol. 2016, 50, (5), 2264-2271.
- 893 44. Bertola, M.; Mattarozzi, M.; Sanangelantoni, A. M.; Careri, M.; Visioli, G., PGPB Colonizing 894 Three-Year Biochar-Amended Soil: Towards Biochar-Mediated Biofertilization. J. Soil Sci Plant 895 Nutri. 2019, 19, (4), 841-850.
  - Page 47

- 45. Gorovtsov, A. V.; Minkina, T. M.; Mandzhieva, S. S.; Perelomov, L. V.; Soja, G.; Zamulina,
- 897 I. V.; Rajput, V. D.; Sushkova, S. N.; Mohan, D.; Yao, J., The mechanisms of biochar interactions
  898 with microorganisms in soil. *Environ. Geochem. Health* 2020, *42*, (8), 2495-2518.
- 899 46. Birk, J. J.; Steiner, C.; Teixiera, W. C.; Zech, W.; Glaser, B., Microbial response to charcoal
  900 amendments and fertilization of a highly weathered tropical soil. In *Amazonian Dark Earths: Wim*901 *Sombroek's Vision*, 2009; pp 309-324.
- 47. Zackrisson, O.; Nilsson, M. C.; Wardle, D. A., Key ecological function of charcoal from
  wildfire in the Boreal forest. *Oikos* 1996, 77, (1), 10-19.
- 904 48. Quilliam, R. S.; Glanville, H. C.; Wade, S. C.; Jones, D. L., Life in the 'charosphere' Does
  905 biochar in agricultural soil provide a significant habitat for microorganisms? *Soil Biol. Biochem.* 2013,
  906 65, 287-293.
- 49. Luo, Y.; Durenkamp, M.; De Nobili, M.; Lin, Q.; Devonshire, B. J.; Brookes, P. C., Microbial
  biomass growth, following incorporation of biochars produced at 350 degrees C or 700 degrees C, in
  a silty-clay loam soil of high and low pH. *Soil Biol Biochem* 2013, *57*, 513-523.
- 50. Kuzyakov, Y.; Subbotina, I.; Chen, H.; Bogomolova, I.; Xu, X., Black carbon decomposition
  and incorporation into soil microbial biomass estimated by 14C labeling. *Soil Biol. Biochem.* 2009,
  41, (2), 210-219.
- 913 51. Quan, G.; Fan, Q.; Zimmerman, A. R.; Sun, J.; Cui, L.; Wang, H.; Gao, B.; Yan, J., Effects
  914 of laboratory biotic aging on the characteristics of biochar and its water-soluble organic products. *J.*915 *Hazard. Mater.* 2020, *382*.

916	52.	Mia, S.; Dijkstra, F. A.; Singh, B., Long-Term Aging of Biochar: A Molecular Understanding
917	With A	Agricultural and Environmental Implications. In Advances in Agronomy, 2017; Vol. 141, pp 1-
918	51.	
919	53.	Ameloot, N.; Graber, E. R.; Verheijen, F. G. A.; De Neve, S., Interactions between biochar
920	stabili	ty and soil organisms: Review and research needs. Eur. J. Soil Sci. 2013, 64, (4), 379-390.
921	54.	Bamminger, C.; Poll, C.; Sixt, C.; Högy, P.; Wüst, D.; Kandeler, E.; Marhan, S., Short-term
922	respon	use of soil microorganisms to biochar addition in a temperate agroecosystem under soil warming.
923	Agric.	Ecosyst. Environ. 2016, 233, 308-317.
924	55.	Ruiz-Dueñas, F. J.; Martínez, Á. T., Microbial degradation of lignin: How a bulky recalcitrant
925	polym	er is efficiently recycled in nature and how we can take advantage of this. <i>Microb. Biotechnol.</i>
926	2009,	2, (2 SPEC. ISS.), 164-177.
927	56.	Ten Have, R.; Teunissen, P. J. M., Oxidative mechanisms involved in lignin degradation by
928	white-	rot fungi. Chem. Rev. 2001, 101, (11), 3397-3413.
929	57.	Chi, Y.; Hatakka, A.; Maijala, P., Can co-culturing of two white-rot fungi increase lignin
930	degrad	lation and the production of lignin-degrading enzymes? Int. Biodeterior. Biodegrad. 2007, 59,
931	(1), 32	2-39.
932	58.	Acevedo, F.; Pizzul, L.; Castillo, M. D. P.; Cuevas, R.; Diez, M. C., Degradation of polycyclic

aromatic hydrocarbons by the Chilean white-rot fungus Anthracophyllum discolor. *J. Hazard. Mater.*2011, *185*, (1), 212-219.

# Page 49

935 59. In der Wiesche, C.; Martens, R.; Zadrazil, F., The effect of interaction between white-rot fungi
936 and indigenous microorganisms on degradation of polycyclic aromatic hydrocarbons in soil. *Water*937 *Air Soil Pollut. Focus* 2003, *3*, (3), 73-79.

938 60. Wiednera, K.; Glaserb, B., Biochar-fungi interactions in soils. In *Biochar and Soil Biota*, 2013;
939 pp 69-99.

Bamminger, C.; Zaiser, N.; Zinsser, P.; Lamers, M.; Kammann, C.; Marhan, S., Effects of
biochar, earthworms, and litter addition on soil microbial activity and abundance in a temperate
agricultural soil. *Biol. Fertil. Soils* 2014, *50*, (8).

Wang, H. T.; Ding, J.; Chi, Q. Q.; Li, G.; Pu, Q.; Xiao, Z. F.; Xue, X. M., The effect of biochar
on soil-plant-earthworm-bacteria system in metal(loid) contaminated soil. *Environ. Pollut.* 2020, *263*.

Augustenborg, C. A.; Hepp, S.; Kammann, C.; Hagan, D.; Schmidt, O.; Müller, C., Biochar
and earthworm effects on soil nitrous oxide and carbon dioxide emissions. *J. Environ. Qual.* 2012, *41*, (4), 1203-1209.

64. Zhang, X.-K.; Li, Q.; Liang, W.-J.; Zhang, M.; Bao, X.-L.; Xie, Z.-B., Soil Nematode
Response to Biochar Addition in a Chinese Wheat Field. *Pedosphere* 2013, *23*, (1), 98-103.

950 65. Phillips, D. H.; Foss, J. E.; Buckner, E. R.; Evans, R. M.; FitzPatrick, E. A., Response of

- surface horizons in an oak forest to prescribed burning. Soil Sci. Soc. Am. J. 2000, 64, (2), 754-760.
- 66. Lehmann, J.; Rillig, M. C.; Thies, J.; Masiello, C. A.; Hockaday, W. C.; Crowley, D., Biochar
  effects on soil biota A review. *Soil Biol. Biochem.* 2011, *43*, (9), 1812-1836.

### Page 50

954	67.	Zimmerman, A. R., Abiotic and microbial oxidation of laboratory-produced black carbon
955	(bioch	ar). Environ. Sci. Technol. 2010, 44, (4), 1295-1301.
956	68.	Cheng, C. H.; Lehmann, J.; Thies, J. E.; Burton, S. D.; Engelhard, M. H., Oxidation of black
957	carbor	by biotic and abiotic processes. Org. Geochem. 2006, 37, (11), 1477-1488.
958	69.	Cheng, C. H.; Lehmann, J.; Engelhard, M. H., Natural oxidation of black carbon in soils:
959	Chang	es in molecular form and surface charge along a climosequence. Geochim. Cosmochim. Acta

- **2008**, *72*, (6), 1598-1610.
- 961 70. Shi, K.; Xie, Y.; Qiu, Y., Natural oxidation of a temperature series of biochars: Opposite effect
  962 on the sorption of aromatic cationic herbicides. *Ecotoxicol. Environ. Saf.* 2015, *114*, 102-108.
- 963 71. Fan, Q.; Sun, J.; Chu, L.; Cui, L.; Quan, G.; Yan, J.; Hussain, Q.; Iqbal, M., Effects of chemical
  964 oxidation on surface oxygen-containing functional groups and adsorption behavior of biochar.
  965 *Chemosphere* 2018, *207*, 33-40.
- Wang, H.; Feng, M.; Zhou, F.; Huang, X.; Tsang, D. C. W.; Zhang, W., Effects of atmospheric
  ageing under different temperatures on surface properties of sludge-derived biochar and
  metal/metalloid stabilization. *Chemosphere* 2017, *184*, 176-184.
- Yan, X.-L.; Li, C.-P.; Arulrajah, A.; Wang, F.;
  Wang, S., Field evaluation of a new hydroxyapatite based binder for ex-situ solidification/stabilization
  of a heavy metal contaminated site soil around a Pb-Zn smelter. *Construction and Building Materials*2019, *210*, 278-288.

973 74. Qian, L.; Chen, M.; Chen, B., Competitive adsorption of cadmium and aluminum onto fresh
974 and oxidized biochars during aging processes. *J. Soils Sed.* 2015, *15*, (5), 1130-1138.

975 75. Feng, M.; Zhang, W.; Wu, X.; Jia, Y.; Jiang, C.; Wei, H.; Qiu, R.; Tsang, D. C. W.,
976 Continuous leaching modifies the surface properties and metal(loid) sorption of sludge-derived
977 biochar. *Sci. Total Environ.* 2018, 625, 731-737.

- 76. Xu, Z.; Xu, X.; Tsang, D. C. W.; Cao, X., Contrasting impacts of pre- and post-application
  aging of biochar on the immobilization of Cd in contaminated soils. *Environ. Pollut.* 2018, *242*, 13621370.
- 77. Hale, S.; Hanley, K.; Lehmann, J.; Zimmerman, A.; Cornelissen, G., Effects of chemical,
  biological, and physical aging as well as soil addition on the sorption of pyrene to activated carbon
  and biochar. *Environ. Sci. Technol.* 2011, *45*, (24), 10445-10453.
- 984 78. Bostick, K. W.; Zimmerman, A. R.; Goranov, A. I.; Mitra, S.; Hatcher, P. G.; Wozniak, A.
  985 S., Photolability of pyrogenic dissolved organic matter from a thermal series of laboratory-prepared
  986 chars. *Sci. Total Environ.* 2020, *724*.
- Fu, H.; Liu, H.; Mao, J.; Chu, W.; Li, Q.; Alvarez, P. J. J.; Qu, X.; Zhu, D., Photochemistry
  of Dissolved Black Carbon Released from Biochar: Reactive Oxygen Species Generation and
  Phototransformation. *Environ. Sci. Technol.* 2016, *50*, (3), 1218-1226.
- 80. Fang, G.; Liu, C.; Wang, Y.; Dionysiou, D. D.; Zhou, D., Photogeneration of reactive oxygen
  species from biochar suspension for diethyl phthalate degradation. *Appl. Catal. B Environ.* 2017, *214*,
  34-45.

993	81. Arnbjerg, J.; Paterson, M. J.; Nielsen, C. B.; Jørgensen, M.; Christiansen, O.; Ogilby, P.	. R.,
994	One- and two-photon photosensitized singlet oxygen production: Characterization of aroma	atic
995	ketones as sensitizer standards. J Phys Chem A 2007, 111, (26), 5756-5767.	

82. Chin, K. K.; Trevithick-Sutton, C. C.; McCallum, J.; Jockusch, S.; Turro, N. J.; Scaiano, J.
69. C.; Foote, C. S.; Garcia-Garibay, M. A., Quantitative determination of singlet oxygen generated by
excited state aromatic amino acids, proteins, and immunoglobulins. *J. Am. Chem. Soc.* 2008, *130*,

- 999 (22), 6912-6913.
- 1000 83. Zhang, D.; Yan, S.; Song, W., Photochemically induced formation of reactive oxygen species

1001 (ROS) from effluent organic matter. *Environ. Sci. Technol.* 2014, 48, (21), 12645-12653.

- 1002 84. Rafiq, M. K.; Bai, Y.; Aziz, R.; Rafiq, M. T.; Mašek, O.; Bachmann, R. T.; Joseph, S.;
- Shahbaz, M.; Qayyum, A.; Shang, Z.; Danaee, M.; Long, R., Biochar amendment improves alpine
  meadows growth and soil health in Tibetan plateau over a three year period. *Sci. Total Environ.* 2020, *717.*
- 1006 85. Zhao, R.; Coles, N.; Wu, J., Carbon mineralization following additions of fresh and aged
  1007 biochar to an infertile soil. *Catena* 2015, *125*, 183-189.
- 1008 86. Bhatta Kaudal, B.; Weatherley, A. J., Agronomic effectiveness of urban biochar aged through
  1009 co-composting with food waste. *Waste Manage*. 2018, 77, 87-97.
- 1010 87. Trigo, C.; Spokas, K. A.; Hall, K. E.; Cox, L.; Koskinen, W. C., Metolachlor Sorption and
  1011 Degradation in Soil Amended with Fresh and Aged Biochars. *J. Agric. Food Chem.* 2016, *64*, (16),
  1012 3141-3149.

1013	88. Chang, Z.; Tian, L.; Wu, M.; Dong, X.; Peng, J.; Pan, B., Molecular markers of benzene
1014	polycarboxylic acids in describing biochar physiochemical properties and sorption characteristics.
1015	Environ. Pollut. 2018, 237, 541-548.

- 1016 89. Tan, L.; Sun, C.; Wang, Y.; Wang, T.; Wu, G. L.; He, H.; Zheng, J., Changes in biochar 1017 properties in typical loess soil under a 5-year field experiment. *J. Soils Sed.* **2020**, *20*, (1), 340-351.
- 1018 90. Gámiz, B.; Velarde, P.; Spokas, K. A.; Celis, R.; Cox, L., Changes in sorption and
  1019 bioavailability of herbicides in soil amended with fresh and aged biochar. *Geoderma* 2019, *337*, 3411020 349.
- 1021 91. Thommes, M.; Kaneko, K.; Neimark, A. V.; Olivier, J. P.; Rodriguez-Reinoso, F.; Rouquerol,
- 1022 J.; Sing, K. S. W., Physisorption of gases, with special reference to the evaluation of surface area and
- 1023 pore size distribution (IUPAC Technical Report). Pure Appl. Chem. 2015, 87, (9-10), 1051-1069.
- 1024 92. Tan, X.; Liu, Y.; Zeng, G.; Wang, X.; Hu, X.; Gu, Y.; Yang, Z., Application of biochar for
  1025 the removal of pollutants from aqueous solutions. *Chemosphere* 2015, *125*, 70-85.
- 1026 93. Chang, R.; Sohi, S. P.; Jing, F.; Liu, Y.; Chen, J., A comparative study on biochar properties
  1027 and Cd adsorption behavior under effects of ageing processes of leaching, acidification and oxidation.
  1028 *Environ. Pollut.* 2019, *254*.
- Wang, Y.; Zhang, W.; Shang, J.; Shen, C.; Joseph, S. D., Chemical aging changed aggregation
  kinetics and transport of biochar colloids. *Environ. Sci. Technol.* 2019, *53*, (14), 8136-8146.
- 1031 95. Ding, Y.; Liu, Y.; Liu, S.; Li, Z.; Tan, X.; Huang, X.; Zeng, G.; Zhou, L.; Zheng, B., Biochar
- 1032 to improve soil fertility. A review. *Agron. Sustainable Dev.* **2016**, *36*, (2).

- 1033 96. Nie, T.; Hao, P.; Zhao, Z.; Zhou, W.; Zhu, L., Effect of oxidation-induced aging on the
  1034 adsorption and co-adsorption of tetracycline and Cu 2+ onto biochar. *Sci. Total Environ.* 2019, *673*,
  1035 522-532.
- 1036 97. Liu, Y.; Sohi, S. P.; Jing, F.; Chen, J., Oxidative ageing induces change in the functionality of
  1037 biochar and hydrochar: Mechanistic insights from sorption of atrazine. *Environ. Pollut.* 2019, *249*,
  1038 1002-1010.
- 1039 98. He, Y.; Liu, C.; Tang, X. Y.; Xian, Q. S.; Zhang, J. Q.; Guan, Z., Biochar impacts on sorption1040 desorption of oxytetracycline and florfenicol in an alkaline farmland soil as affected by field ageing.
  1041 *Sci. Total Environ.* 2019, 671, 928-936.
- Mia, S.; Dijkstra, F. A.; Singh, B., Aging Induced Changes in Biochar's Functionality and
  Adsorption Behavior for Phosphate and Ammonium. *Environ. Sci. Technol.* 2017, *51*, (15), 83598367.
- 1045 100. Walker, V. K.; Palmer, G. R.; Voordouw, G., Freeze-thaw tolerance and clues to the winter 1046 survival of a soil community. *Appl. Environ. Microbiol.* **2006**, *72*, (3), 1784-1792.
- 1047 101. Meyer, A. F.; Lipson, D. A.; Martín, A. P.; Schadt, C. W.; Schmidt, S. K., Molecular and
- Metabolic Characterization of Cold-Tolerant Alpine Soil Pseudomonas Sensu Stricto. *Appl. Environ. Microbiol.* 2004, 70, (1), 483-489.
- 1050 102. Vonk, J. E.; Tank, S. E.; Mann, P. J.; Spencer, R. G. M.; Treat, C. C.; Striegl, R. G.; Abbott,
- 1051 B. W.; Wickland, K. P., Biodegradability of dissolved organic carbon in permafrost soils and aquatic
- 1052 systems: A meta-analysis. *Biogeosciences* **2015**, *12*, (23), 6915-6930.

- 1053 103. MacKelprang, R.; Waldrop, M. P.; Deangelis, K. M.; David, M. M.; Chavarria, K. L.;
- Blazewicz, S. J.; Rubin, E. M.; Jansson, J. K., Metagenomic analysis of a permafrost microbial community reveals a rapid response to thaw. *Nature* **2011**, *480*, (7377), 368-371.
- 1056 104. Xiao, X.; Chen, Z.; Chen, B., H/C atomic ratio as a smart linkage between pyrolytic
  1057 temperatures, aromatic clusters and sorption properties of biochars derived from diverse precursory
  1058 materials. *Sci. Rep.* 2016, *6*.
- 1059 105. Cheng, C.-H.; Lehmann, J.; Thies, J. E.; Burton, S. D.; Engelhard, M. H., Oxidation of black 1060 carbon by biotic and abiotic processes. *Org. Geochem.* **2006**, *37*, (11), 1477-1488.
- 1061 106. Ameur, D.; Zehetner, F.; Johnen, S.; Jöchlinger, L.; Pardeller, G.; Wimmer, B.; Rosner, F.;
- Faber, F.; Dersch, G.; Zechmeister-Boltenstern, S.; Mentler, A.; Soja, G.; Keiblinger, K. M.,
  Activated biochar alters activities of carbon and nitrogen acquiring soil enzymes. *Pedobiologia* 2018,
  69, 1-10.
- 1065 107. Mukherjee, A.; Zimmerman, A. R.; Hamdan, R.; Cooper, W. T., Physicochemical changes in 1066 pyrogenic organic matter (biochar) after 15 months of field aging. *Solid Earth* **2014**, *5*, (2), 693-704.
- 1067 108. Bakshi, S.; Aller, D. M.; Laird, D. A.; Chintala, R., Comparison of the physical and chemical
  1068 properties of laboratory and field-aged biochars. *J. Environ. Qual.* 2016, *45*, (5), 1627-1634.
- 1069 109. Lawrinenko, M.; Laird, D. A.; Johnson, R. L.; Jing, D., Accelerated aging of biochars: Impact
  1070 on anion exchange capacity. *Carbon* 2016, *103*, 217-227.
- 1071 110. Lawrinenko, M.; Laird, D. A., Anion exchange capacity of biochar. *Green Chem.* 2015, *17*,
  1072 (9), 4628-4636.

- 1073 111. Uchimiya, M.; Klasson, K. T.; Wartelle, L. H.; Lima, I. M., Influence of soil properties on
- 1074 heavy metal sequestration by biochar amendment: 1. Copper sorption isotherms and the release of
- 1075 cations. *Chemosphere* **2011**, *82*, (10), 1431-1437.
- 1076 112. Chao, X.; Qian, X.; Han-hua, Z.; Shuai, W.; Qi-hong, Z.; Dao-you, H.; Yang-zhu, Z., Effect
- 1077 of biochar from peanut shell on speciation and availability of lead and zinc in an acidic paddy soil.
- 1078 Ecotox. Environ. Safe. 2018, 164, 554-561.
- 1079 113. Qi, F.; Dong, Z.; Lamb, D.; Naidu, R.; Bolan, N. S.; Ok, Y. S.; Liu, C.; Khan, N.; Johir, M.
- 1080 A. H.; Semple, K. T., Effects of acidic and neutral biochars on properties and cadmium retention of
- 1081 soils. Chemosphere 2017, 180, 564-573.
- 1082 114. Bian, R.; Joseph, S.; Cui, L.; Pan, G.; Li, L.; Liu, X.; Zhang, A.; Rutlidge, H.; Wong, S.; Chia,
- 1083 C.; Marjo, C.; Gong, B.; Munroe, P.; Donne, S., A three-year experiment confirms continuous
  1084 immobilization of cadmium and lead in contaminated paddy field with biochar amendment. *J. Hazard.*1085 *Mater.* 2014, *272*, 121-128.
- 1086 115. Wang, S.; Gao, B.; Li, Y., Enhanced arsenic removal by biochar modified with nickel (Ni)
  1087 and manganese (Mn) oxyhydroxides. *J. Ind. Eng. Chem.* 2016, *37*, 361-365.
- 1088 116. Yang, Y.; Chen, N.; Feng, C.; Li, M.; Gao, Y., Chromium removal using a magnetic corncob 1089 biochar/polypyrrole composite by adsorption combined with reduction: Reaction pathway and 1090 contribution degree. *Colloids Surf. A Physicochem. Eng. Asp.* **2018**, *556*, 201-209.
- 1091 117. Mao, J. D.; Johnson, R. L.; Lehmann, J.; Olk, D. C.; Neves, E. G.; Thompson, M. L.; Schmidt-1092 Rohr, K., Abundant and stable char residues in soils: Implications for soil fertility and carbon 1093 sequestration. *Environ. Sci. Technol.* **2012**, *46*, (17), 9571-9576.

- 1094 118. Leng, L.; Huang, H.; Li, H.; Li, J.; Zhou, W., Biochar stability assessment methods: A review.
  1095 *Sci. Total Environ.* 2019, 647, 210-222.
- 1096 119. Singh, B.; Camps-Arbestain, M.; Lehmann, J., *Biochar: a guide to analytical methods*. Csiro
  1097 Publishing: 2017.
- 1098 120. Hammes, K.; Torn, M. S.; Lapenas, A. G.; Schmidt, M. W. I., Centennial black carbon 1099 turnover observed in a Russian steppe soil. *Biogeosciences* **2008**, *5*, (5), 1339-1350.
- 1100 121. Esfandbod, M.; Phillips, I. R.; Miller, B.; Rashti, M. R.; Lan, Z. M.; Srivastava, P.; Singh, B.;
- 1101 Chen, C. R., Aged acidic biochar increases nitrogen retention and decreases ammonia volatilization
- 1102 in alkaline bauxite residue sand. *Ecol. Eng.* **2017**, *98*, 157-165.
- 1103 122. Hardy, B.; Leifeld, J.; Knicker, H.; Dufey, J. E.; Deforce, K.; Cornélis, J. T., Long term change
- 1104 in chemical properties of preindustrial charcoal particles aged in forest and agricultural temperate soil.
- 1105 Org. Geochem. 2017, 107, 33-45.
- 1106 123. Gao, Y.; Li, T.; Fu, Q.; Li, H.; Liu, D.; Ji, Y.; Li, Q.; Cai, Y., Biochar application for the
- 1107 improvement of water-soil environments and carbon emissions under freeze-thaw conditions: An in-
- 1108 situ field trial. Sci. Total Environ. 2020, 723.
- 1109 124. Cao, Y.; Jing, Y.; Hao, H.; Wang, X., Changes in the physicochemical characteristics of
  peanut straw biochar after freeze-thaw and dry-wet aging treatments of the biomass. *BioResour.* 2019,
  1111 14, (2), 4329-4343.
- 1112 125. Kumar, H.; Cai, W.; Lai, J.; Chen, P.; Ganesan, S. P.; Bordoloi, S.; Liu, X.; Wen, Y. P.; Garg,
- 1113 A.; Mei, G., Influence of in-house produced biochars on cracks and retained water during drying-

- wetting cycles: comparison between conventional plant, animal, and nano-biochars. J. Soils Sed. 2020,
  20, (4), 1983-1996.
- 1116 126. Li, H.; Lu, X.; Xu, Y.; Liu, H., How close is artificial biochar aging to natural biochar aging
- 1117 in fields? A meta-analysis. *Geoderma* **2019**, *352*, 96-103.
- 1118 127. Fan, Q.; Cui, L.; Quan, G.; Wang, S.; Sun, J.; Han, X.; Wang, J.; Yan, J., Effects of wet
- 1119 oxidation process on biochar surface in acid and alkaline soil environments. *Mater.* 2018, *11*, (12).
- 1120 128. Clarholm, M.; Skyllberg, U.; Rosling, A., Organic acid induced release of nutrients from
- 1121 metal-stabilized soil organic matter The unbutton model. Soil Biol. Biochem. 2015, 84, 168-176.
- 1122 129. Lou, L.; Luo, L.; Wang, L.; Cheng, G.; Xu, X.; Hou, J.; Xun, B.; Hu, B.; Chen, Y., The
- 1123 influence of acid demineralization on surface characteristics of black carbon and its sorption for
- 1124 pentachlorophenol. J. Colloid Interface Sci. 2011, 361, (1), 226-231.
- 1125 130. Ren, X.; Sun, H.; Wang, F.; Cao, F., The changes in biochar properties and sorption capacities
- after being cultured with wheat for 3 months. *Chemosphere* **2016**, *144*, 2257-2263.
- 1127 131. Rechberger, M. V.; Kloss, S.; Wang, S. L.; Lehmann, J.; Rennhofer, H.; Ottner, F.; Wriessnig,
- 1128 K.; Daudin, G.; Lichtenegger, H.; Soja, G.; Zehetner, F., Enhanced Cu and Cd sorption after soil aging
- of woodchip-derived biochar: What were the driving factors? *Chemosphere* **2019**, *216*, 463-471.
- 1130 132. Aller, D.; Rathke, S.; Laird, D.; Cruse, R.; Hatfield, J., Impacts of fresh and aged biochars on
- 1131 plant available water and water use efficiency. *Geoderma* **2017**, *307*, 114-121.
- 1132 133. Lentz, R. D.; Ippolito, J. A.; Lehrsch, G. A., Biochar, Manure, and Sawdust Alter Long-Term
- 1133 Water Retention Dynamics in Degraded Soil. *Soil Sci. Soc. Am. J.* **2019**, *83*, (5), 1491-1501.

- 1134 134. Günal, E.; Erdem, H.; Çelik, İ., Effects of three different biochars amendment on water
- retention of silty loam and loamy soils. *Agric. Water Manage.* **2018**, *208*, 232-244.
- 1136 135. Abiven, S.; Menasseri, S.; Chenu, C., The effects of organic inputs over time on soil aggregate
- stability A literature analysis. Soil Biol. Biochem. 2009, 41, (1), 1-12.
- 1138 136. Diacono, M.; Montemurro, F., Long-term effects of organic amendments on soil fertility. A
  1139 review. *Agron. Sustainable Dev.* 2010, *30*, (2), 401-422.
- 1140 137. Rashid, M. I.; Mujawar, L. H.; Shahzad, T.; Almeelbi, T.; Ismail, I. M. I.; Oves, M., Bacteria
- 1141 and fungi can contribute to nutrients bioavailability and aggregate formation in degraded soils.
- 1142 *Microbiol Res.* **2016**, *183*, 26-41.
- 1143 138. Burrell, L. D.; Zehetner, F.; Rampazzo, N.; Wimmer, B.; Soja, G., Long-term effects of
  biochar on soil physical properties. *Geoderma* 2016, *282*, 96-102.
- 1145 139. Hou, R.; Wang, L.; O'Connor, D.; Tsang, D. C. W.; Rinklebe, J.; Hou, D., Effect of
  1146 immobilizing reagents on soil Cd and Pb lability under freeze-thaw cycles: Implications for
  1147 sustainable agricultural management in seasonally frozen land. *Environ. Int.* 2020, *144*, 106040.
- 1148 140. Atkinson, C. J.; Fitzgerald, J. D.; Hipps, N. A., Potential mechanisms for achieving
  agricultural benefits from biochar application to temperate soils: A review. *Plant Soil* 2010, *337*, (1),
  1150 1-18.
- 1151 141. Gregory, J., Interaction of unequal double layers at constant charge. *J. Colloid Interface Sci.*1152 **1975,** *51*, (1), 44-51.

- 1153 142. Soinne, H.; Hovi, J.; Tammeorg, P.; Turtola, E., Effect of biochar on phosphorus sorption and
- 1154 clay soil aggregate stability. *Geoderma* **2014**, *219-220*, 162-167.
- 1155 143. Liang, B.; Lehmann, J.; Sohi, S. P.; Thies, J. E.; O'Neill, B.; Trujillo, L.; Gaunt, J.; Solomon,
- 1156 D.; Grossman, J.; Neves, E. G.; Luizão, F. J., Black carbon affects the cycling of non-black carbon in
- 1157 soil. Org. Geochem. 2010, 41, (2), 206-213.
- 1158 144. Rillig, M. C., Arbuscular mycorrhizae, glomalin, and soil aggregation. *Can. J. Soil Sci.* 2004,
  1159 84, (4), 355-363.
- 1160 145. Heitkötter, J.; Marschner, B., Interactive effects of biochar ageing in soils related to feedstock,
- 1161 pyrolysis temperature, and historic charcoal production. *Geoderma* **2015**, *245-246*, 56-64.
- 1162 146. Lehmann, J., Bio-energy in the black. *Frontiers Ecol. Envir.* 2007, *5*, (7), 381-387.
- 1163 147. Liang, B.; Lehmann, J.; Solomon, D.; Kinyangi, J.; Grossman, J.; O'Neill, B.; Skjemstad, J.
- 1164 O.; Thies, J.; Luizão, F. J.; Petersen, J.; Neves, E. G., Black carbon increases cation exchange capacity
- 1165 in soils. Soil Sci. Soc. Am. J. 2006, 70, (5), 1719-1730.
- 148. Sahin, O.; Taskin, M. B.; Kaya, E. C.; Atakol, O.; Emir, E.; Inal, A.; Gunes, A., Effect of acid
  modification of biochar on nutrient availability and maize growth in a calcareous soil. *Soil Use Manage.* 2017, *33*, (3), 447-456.
- 1169 149. Bai, N.; Zhang, H.; Zhou, S.; Sun, H.; Zhao, Y.; Zheng, X.; Li, S.; Zhang, J.; Lv, W., Long-
- 1170 term effects of straw return and straw-derived biochar amendment on bacterial communities in soil
- 1171 aggregates. Sci. Rep. 2020, 10, (1).

- 1172 150. Li, X.; Wang, T.; Chang, S. X.; Jiang, X.; Song, Y., Biochar increases soil microbial biomass
- 1173 but has variable effects on microbial diversity: A meta-analysis. *Sci. Total Environ.* **2020**, 141593.
- 1174 151. Qian, L.; Chen, B., Interactions of aluminum with biochars and oxidized biochars:
- 1175 Implications for the biochar aging process. J. Agric. Food Chem. 2014, 62, (2), 373-380.
- 1176 152. Hao, H.; Jing, Y. D.; Ju, W. L.; Shen, L.; Cao, Y. Q., Different types of biochar: Effect of
- aging on the Cu(II) adsorption behavior. *Desalin. Water Treat.* 2017, 95, 227-233.
- 1178 153. Shen, Z.; Hou, D.; Zhao, B.; Xu, W.; Ok, Y. S.; Bolan, N. S.; Alessi, D. S., Stability of heavy
- metals in soil washing residue with and without biochar addition under accelerated ageing. *Sci. Total Environ.* 2018, *619-620*, 185-193.
- 1181 154. Wang, L.; Bolan, N. S.; Tsang, D. C. W.; Hou, D., Green immobilization of toxic metals using
  alkaline enhanced rice husk biochar: Effects of pyrolysis temperature and KOH concentration. *Sci. Total Environ.* 2020, *720.*
- 1184 155. Komarek, M.; Vanek, A.; Ettler, V., Chemical stabilization of metals and arsenic in
  1185 contaminated soils using oxides A review. *Environ. Pollut.* 2013, *172*, 9-22.
- 1186 156. Raeisi, S.; Motaghian, H.; Hosseinpur, A. R., Effect of the soil biochar aging on the sorption
  and desorption of Pb2+ under competition of Zn2+ in a sandy calcareous soil. *Environ. Earth Sci.*2020, 79, (6).
- 1189 157. Li, H.; Ye, X.; Geng, Z.; Zhou, H.; Guo, X.; Zhang, Y.; Zhao, H.; Wang, G., The influence of
  biochar type on long-term stabilization for Cd and Cu in contaminated paddy soils. *J. Hazard. Mater.*1191 2016, *304*, 40-48.

1192	158.	Ghaffar, A.; Ghosh, S.; Li, F.; Dong, X.; Zhang, D.; Wu, M.; Li, H.; Pan, B., Effect of biochar
1193	aging	on surface characteristics and adsorption behavior of dialkyl phthalates. Environ. Pollut. 2015,
1194	206, 5	02-509.

1195 159. Tran, H. N.; You, S.-J.; Hosseini-Bandegharaei, A.; Chao, H.-P., Mistakes and inconsistencies
regarding adsorption of contaminants from aqueous solutions: A critical review. *Water Res.* 2017,
1197 120, 88-116.

1198 160. Keiluweit, M.; Nico, P. S.; Johnson, M.; Kleber, M., Dynamic molecular structure of plant
1199 biomass-derived black carbon (biochar). *Environ. Sci. Technol.* 2010, 44, (4), 1247-1253.

1200 161. Ren, X.; Sun, H.; Wang, F.; Zhang, P.; Zhu, H., Effect of aging in field soil on biochar's
1201 properties and its sorption capacity. *Environ. Pollut.* 2018, *242*, 1880-1886.

1202 162. Zhang, X.; Sarmah, A. K.; Bolan, N. S.; He, L.; Lin, X.; Che, L.; Tang, C.; Wang, H., Effect
1203 of aging process on adsorption of diethyl phthalate in soils amended with bamboo biochar.
1204 *Chemosphere* 2016, *142*, 28-34.

1205 163. Ren, X.; Yuan, X.; Sun, H., Dynamic changes in atrazine and phenanthrene sorption behaviors
1206 during the aging of biochar in soils. *Environ. Sci. Pollut. Res.* 2018, *25*, (1), 81-90.

1207 164. Zhu, X.; Chen, B.; Zhu, L.; Xing, B., Effects and mechanisms of biochar-microbe interactions

- in soil improvement and pollution remediation: A review. *Environ. Pollut.* 2017, 227, 98-115.
- 1209 165. Chen, S.; Rotaru, A. E.; Shrestha, P. M.; Malvankar, N. S.; Liu, F.; Fan, W.; Nevin, K. P.;
- 1210 Lovley, D. R., Promoting interspecies electron transfer with biochar. Sci. Rep. 2014, 4.

- 1211 166. Yu, L.; Yuan, Y.; Tang, J.; Wang, Y.; Zhou, S., Biochar as an electron shuttle for reductive
- 1212 dechlorination of pentachlorophenol by Geobacter sulfurreducens. Sci. Rep. 2015, 5.
- 1213 167. Han Weng, Z.; Van Zwieten, L.; Singh, B. P.; Tavakkoli, E.; Joseph, S.; Macdonald, L. M.;
- 1214 Rose, T. J.; Rose, M. T.; Kimber, S. W. L.; Morris, S.; Cozzolino, D.; Araujo, J. R.; Archanjo, B. S.;
- 1215 Cowie, A., Biochar built soil carbon over a decade by stabilizing rhizodeposits. *Nat. Clim. Change*
- 1216 **2017,** *7*, (5), 371-376.
- 1217 168. Blanco-Canqui, H., Biochar and soil physical properties. *Soil Sci. Soc. Am. J.* 2017, *81*, (4),
  1218 687-711.
- 1219 169. Zheng, H.; Wang, X.; Luo, X.; Wang, Z.; Xing, B., Biochar-induced negative carbon
  1220 mineralization priming effects in a coastal wetland soil: Roles of soil aggregation and microbial
  1221 modulation. *Sci. Total Environ.* 2018, *610-611*, 951-960.
- 1222 170. Lützow, M. V.; Kögel-Knabner, I.; Ekschmitt, K.; Matzner, E.; Guggenberger, G.; Marschner,
- 1223 B.; Flessa, H., Stabilization of organic matter in temperate soils: Mechanisms and their relevance
- 1224 under different soil conditions A review. Eur. J. Soil Sci. 2006, 57, (4), 426-445.
- 1225 171. Fang, B.; Lee, X.; Zhang, J.; Li, Y.; Zhang, L.; Cheng, J.; Wang, B.; Cheng, H., Impacts of
  1226 straw biochar additions on agricultural soil quality and greenhouse gas fluxes in karst area, Southwest
  1227 China. *Soil Sci. Plant Nutr.* 2016, *62*, (5-6), 526-533.
- 1228 172. Abagandura, G. O.; Chintala, R.; Sandhu, S. S.; Kumar, S.; Schumacher, T. E., Effects of
- 1229 biochar and manure applications on soil carbon dioxide, methane, and nitrous oxide fluxes from two
- 1230 different soils. J. Environ. Qual. 2019, 48, (6), 1664-1674.

1231	173. Wang, C.; Shen, J.; Liu, J.; Qin, H.; Yuan, Q.; Fan, F.; Hu, Y.; Wang, J.; Wei, W.;	Li, Y.; Wu
1232	J., Microbial mechanisms in the reduction of CH4 emission from double rice cropp	oing system
1233	amended by biochar: A four-year study. Soil Biol. Biochem. 2019, 135, 251-263.	

1234 174. He, L.; Shan, J.; Zhao, X.; Wang, S.; Yan, X., Variable responses of nitrification and
1235 denitrification in a paddy soil to long-term biochar amendment and short-term biochar addition.
1236 *Chemosphere* 2019, *234*, 558-567.

- 1237 175. Duan, P.; Zhang, X.; Zhang, Q.; Wu, Z.; Xiong, Z., Field-aged biochar stimulated N2O
  1238 production from greenhouse vegetable production soils by nitrification and denitrification. *Sci. Total*1239 *Environ.* 2018, *642*, 1303-1310.
- 1240 176. Lin, Q.; Zhang, L.; Riaz, M.; Zhang, M.; Xia, H.; Lv, B.; Jiang, C., "Assessing the potential
  of biochar and aged biochar to alleviate aluminum toxicity in an acid soil for achieving cabbage
  productivity". *Ecotoxicol. Environ. Saf.* 2018, *161*, 290-295.
- 1243 177. Bin, G.; Cao, X.; Dong, Y.; Luo, Y.; Ma, L. Q., Colloid deposition and release in soils and 1244 their association with heavy metals. *Crit. Rev. Environ. Sci. Technol.* **2011**, *41*, (4), 336-372.
- 1245 178. Tong, M.; Li, T.; Li, M.; He, L.; Ma, Z., Cotransport and deposition of biochar with different 1246 sized-plastic particles in saturated porous media. *Sci. Total Environ.* **2020**, *713*.
- 1247 179. Shen, Z.; Jin, F.; O'Connor, D.; Hou, D., Solidification/Stabilization for Soil Remediation: An
- 1248 Old Technology with New Vitality. *Environ. Sci. Technol.* 2019, 53, (20), 11615-11617.
- 1249 180. Shen, Z. T.; Hou, D. Y.; Xu, W. D.; Zhang, J. Z.; Jin, F.; Zhao, B.; Pan, S. Z.; Peng, T. Y.;
- 1250 Alessi, D. S., Assessing long-term stability of cadmium and lead in a soil washing residue amended

### Page 65

- with MgO-based binders using quantitative accelerated ageing. *Sci. Total Environ.* 2018, 643, 15711578.
- 1253 181. Zhao, B.; O'Connor, D.; Shen, Z.; Tsang, D. C.; Rinklebe, J.; Hou, D., Sulfur-modified
  biochar as a soil amendment to stabilize mercury pollution: An accelerated simulation of long-term
  aging effects. *Environ. Pollut.* 2020, 114687.
- 1256 182. Ojeda, G.; Patrício, J.; Mattana, S.; Sobral, A. J. F. N., Effects of biochar addition to estuarine
  1257 sediments. *J. Soils Sed.* 2016, *16*, (10), 2482-2491.
- 1258 183. Wang, M.; Ren, L.; Wang, D.; Cai, Z.; Xia, X.; Ding, A., Assessing the capacity of biochar

to stabilize copper and lead in contaminated sediments using chemical and extraction methods. *J. Environ. Sci.* 2019, *79*, 91-99.

- 1261 184. Yang, X.; Chen, Z.; Wu, Q.; Xu, M., Enhanced phenanthrene degradation in river sediments
  1262 using a combination of biochar and nitrate. *Sci. Total Environ.* 2018, *619-620*, 600-605.
- 1263 185. Zhang, C.; Shan, B.; Zhu, Y.; Tang, W., Remediation effectiveness of Phyllostachys
  1264 pubescens biochar in reducing the bioavailability and bioaccumulation of metals in sediments.
  1265 *Environ. Pollut.* 2018, *242*, 1768-1776.
- 1266 186. Fei, Y. H.; Chen, Y.; Liu, C.; Xiao, T., Biochar Addition Enhances Phenanthrene Fixation in
- 1267 Sediment. Bull. Environ. Contam. Toxicol. 2019, 103, (1), 163-168.
- 1268 187. Lou, L.; Luo, L.; Cheng, G.; Wei, Y.; Mei, R.; Xun, B.; Xu, X.; Hu, B.; Chen, Y., The sorption
- 1269 of pentachlorophenol by aged sediment supplemented with black carbon produced from rice straw
- 1270 and fly ash. *Bioresour. Technol.* **2012**, *112*, 61-66.